Phased Allocation of COVID-19 Vaccines

Kathleen Dooling, MD, MPH
ACIP meeting
December 20, 2020
Objective

Policy Question:

Which groups should be offered COVID-19 vaccination in Phase 1b & 1c?
Work Group Considerations: Goals of the COVID-19 Vaccine Program

- Ensure safety and effectiveness of COVID-19 vaccines
- Reduce transmission, morbidity, mortality of COVID-19 disease
- Help minimize disruption to society and the economy, including maintaining healthcare capacity
- Ensure equity in vaccine allocation and distribution
Work Group considerations: Balancing Goals

Prevention of Morbidity & Mortality

Preservation of Societal Functioning
Work Group considerations: Balancing Goals

Prevention of Morbidity & Mortality

1a LTCF residents

Preservation of Societal Functioning

Health care personnel

- Ensure safety and effectiveness of COVID-19 vaccines
- Ensure equity in vaccine allocation and distribution
Work Group considerations: Balancing Goals

- 10 public ACIP meetings, 28 COVID-19 Work Group meetings
- Evidence: Scientific, Implementation, Ethical
- External Expert Advice
  - National Academies of Science Engineering Medicine
  - Academic Reports
  - International Recommendations
- Public Input
  - Focus groups
  - Population surveys
  - Pandemic preparedness
  - ACIP public comment and federal register
# Work Group considerations: Balancing Goals

## Prevention of Morbidity & Mortality

1a. LTCF residents

1b. Persons 75 years and older

1c. Persons 65-74 years
   Persons 16-64 with high-risk medical conditions

## Preservation of Societal Functioning

- Health care personnel
- Frontline Essential Workers
- Other Essential Workers

- Ensure safety and effectiveness of COVID-19 vaccines
- Ensure equity in vaccine allocation and distribution
## Work Group considerations: Balancing Goals

### Prevention of Morbidity & Mortality

#### 1a
- LTCF residents
- Health care personnel

#### 1b
- Persons 75 years and older
- Frontline Essential Workers

#### 1c
- Persons 65-74 years
- Persons 16-64 with high-risk medical conditions
- Other Essential Workers

### Preservation of Societal Functioning

- Ensure safety and effectiveness of COVID-19 vaccines
- Ensure equity in vaccine allocation and distribution
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase 1</th>
<th>Phase 2</th>
<th>Phase 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Phase 1a “Jumpstart Phase”</strong></td>
<td><strong>K-12 teachers and school staff and child care workers</strong></td>
<td><strong>Workers in industries and occupations important to the functioning of society and at increased risk of exposure not included in Phase 1 or 2</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High-risk health workers</td>
<td>Critical workers in high-risk settings—workers who are in industries essential to the functioning of society and substantially higher risk of exposure</td>
<td><strong>Young adults</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First responders</td>
<td>People of all ages with comorbid and underlying conditions that put them at <em>significantly</em> higher risk</td>
<td><strong>Children</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Phase 1b</strong></td>
<td>People of all ages with comorbid and underlying conditions that put them at <em>moderately</em> higher risk</td>
<td><strong>Workers in industries and occupations important to the functioning of society and at increased risk of exposure not included in Phase 1 or 2</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People of all ages with</td>
<td>People in homeless shelters or group homes for individuals with disabilities, including serious mental illness, development and intellectual disabilities, and physical disabilities or in recovery, and staff who work in such settings</td>
<td><strong>Workers in industries and occupations important to the functioning of society and at increased risk of exposure not included in Phase 1 or 2</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>comorbid and underlying</td>
<td>People in prisons, jails, detention centers, and similar facilities, and staff who work in such settings</td>
<td><strong>Workers in industries and occupations important to the functioning of society and at increased risk of exposure not included in Phase 1 or 2</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>conditions that put them</td>
<td>All older adults not included in Phase 1</td>
<td><strong>Workers in industries and occupations important to the functioning of society and at increased risk of exposure not included in Phase 1 or 2</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>at significantly higher risk</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Workers in industries and occupations important to the functioning of society and at increased risk of exposure not included in Phase 1 or 2</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Older adults <em>living in</em></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Workers in industries and occupations important to the functioning of society and at increased risk of exposure not included in Phase 1 or 2</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>congregate or overcrowded</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Workers in industries and occupations important to the functioning of society and at increased risk of exposure not included in Phase 1 or 2</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>settings</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Workers in industries and occupations important to the functioning of society and at increased risk of exposure not included in Phase 1 or 2</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**NASEM Framework**

Essential Workers* (total ~87M)

Frontline Essential Workers (~30M)
- First Responders (Firefighters, Police)
- Education (teachers, support staff, daycare)
- Food & Agriculture
- Manufacturing
- Corrections workers
- U.S. Postal service workers
- Public transit workers
- Grocery store workers

Other Essential Workers (~57M)
- Transportation and logistics
- Food Service
- Shelter & Housing (construction)
- Finance
- IT & Communication
- Energy
- Media
- Legal
- Public Safety (Engineers)
- Water & Wastewater

Frontline Essential Workers: workers who are in sectors essential to the functioning of society and are at substantially higher risk of exposure to SARS-CoV-2

Proposed Phases of COVID-19 Vaccination

16-64 years with high-risk medical conditions (>110M)

16-64 years Without high-risk medical conditions (<86M)

65-74 years (32M)

75+ years (21M)

Essential Workers

Frontline

HCP

LTCF

Phase 1a

Phase 1b

Phase 1c

Phase 2
Which groups should be recommended to receive COVID-19 vaccines in Phase 1b & 1c?
Science

Implementation

Science

Ethics
COVID-19 incidence is highest in young adults

National Estimate of COVID-19 Incidence per 100,000 Population, by Age Group – Data through Dec 16, 2020

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Group (Years)</th>
<th>COVID-19 Incidence per 100,000 Population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0-4</td>
<td>1135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-17</td>
<td>1944</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18-29</td>
<td>5489</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-39</td>
<td>4671</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40-49</td>
<td>4543</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50-64</td>
<td>3993</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65-74</td>
<td>2977</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75-84</td>
<td>3147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>85+</td>
<td>5064</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

COVID-19 mortality rates are highest in older adults

National Estimate of COVID-19 Deaths per 100,000 Population, by Age Group – Data through Dec 16, 2020

Although overall mortality increases with age, the proportion of deaths associated with COVID-19 is similar across middle-age and older adults.

As of December 16th: [https://www.cdc.gov/nchs/nvss/vsrr/covid_weekly/index.htm](https://www.cdc.gov/nchs/nvss/vsrr/covid_weekly/index.htm)
Adults 75 years and older account for 25% of COVID-19 associated hospitalizations

Data Source: COVID-19 associated hospitalizations reported to Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19)-Associated Hospitalization Surveillance Network (COVID-NET) surveillance system. COVID-NET is a population-based surveillance system that collects data on laboratory-confirmed COVID-19-associated hospitalizations among children and adults through a network of over 250 acute-care hospitals in 14 states.
COVID-19-associated hospitalization rates are highest in older adults

COVID-19-Associated Hospitalization Rates per 100,000 population
Preliminary Weekly Rates as of Dec 5, 2020

Data Source: https://gis.cdc.gov/grasp/COVIDNet/COVID19_3.html
Risk for COVID-19 associated hospitalization increased with the number of underlying medical conditions

Unadjusted and Adjusted\(^a\) Rate Ratios for Number of Underlying Medical Conditions and COVID-19-Associated Hospitalization, COVID-NET March 1- June 23, 2020

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of conditions(^b)</th>
<th>Unadjusted Rate Ratio (95%CI)</th>
<th>Adjusted Rate Ratio(^a) (95%CI)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.8 (2.7, 3.1)</td>
<td>2.5 (2.1, 3.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>5.6 (5.2, 6.1)</td>
<td>4.5 (3.7, 5.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3+</td>
<td>7.2 (6.6, 7.9)</td>
<td>5.0 (3.9, 6.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 45-64 years(^c)</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>1.8 (1.5, 2.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 65+ years(^c)</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>2.6 (2.1, 3.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male sex(^d)</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>1.2 (1.1, 1.4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Hispanic black(^e)</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>3.9 (3.3, 4.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other race/ethnicity(^e)</td>
<td>-----</td>
<td>3.3 (2.8, 3.9)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CI: Confidence Interval; COVID-NET: Coronavirus Disease 2019-Associated Hospitalization Surveillance Network

\(^a\)Model for number of conditions (variable) is adjusted for age, sex, and race/ethnicity

\(^b\)Reference group is no underlying medical condition; Number of conditions is a sum of underlying medical conditions excluding hypertension; the most recent year of available BRFSS data for hypertension was 2017.

\(^c\)Reference group is 18-44 years

\(^d\)Reference group is female

\(^e\)Reference group is non-Hispanic white
Risk of in-hospital death among persons hospitalized for COVID-19 increased with age

Percent seropositive for SARS-CoV-2 IgG antibody, by occupation among workers in public service agencies — New York City, May–July 2020

Other includes Dietary Service Staff, Environmental Service Staff and participants who selected Other and were not reassigned to an existing category.

Other Health includes Student/Trainee, Respiratory Therapist, Occupational/Speech/Physical Therapist, Therapy Aide/Assistant, Pharmacist, Diagnostic Imaging Technician, Phlebotomist, Medical Registrar, Orderly, Dietician, Dentist, Clinical Technician, Medical Assistant. Sami et al. Manuscript in preparation.

High seroprevalence among many frontline essential workers groups following first wave of pandemic in NYC.
Half of essential workers are older than 40 years

- 8-11% are ≥65 years old
- >56% of adults 18-64 years have ≥1 high-risk medical condition

1. Data Source: American Community Survey, 2019  
2. Data source: 2019 Behavioral Risk Factor Surveillance System
Summary of Work Group interpretation: Modeling

- In the scenarios considered, differences between strategies is minimal
  - Vaccinating older adults first averts slightly more deaths, vaccinating younger adults first (essential workers or younger adults with high-risk conditions) averts slightly more infections
  - Ethical principles and implementation considerations also contribute to selecting the optimal sequence in Phase 1b and 1c

- Largest driver of impact in averted deaths and infections is the timing of vaccine introduction in relation to increases in COVID-19 cases
  - Emphasizes the need to continue non-pharmaceutical interventions (e.g. wearing a mask, social distancing to prevent cases so vaccine can have maximum impact)

- Vaccine’s ability to prevent transmission will further inform future modeling analysis and interpretation
Impacts of COVID-19 not represented in models: Late Sequelae of COVID-19

Most commonly reported symptoms include:
fatigue, dyspnea, cough, arthralgia, and chest pain

More serious complications appear to be less common but have been reported:

- Cardiovascular: myocardial inflammation, ventricular dysfunction
- Respiratory: pulmonary function abnormalities
- Renal: acute kidney injury
- Dermatologic: rash, alopecia
- Neurological: olfactory and gustatory dysfunction, sleep dysregulation, altered cognition, memory impairment
- Psychiatric: depression, anxiety, changes in mood

Implementation

Science

Ethics

Implementation
Safety is paramount. Vaccine safety standards will not be compromised in efforts to accelerate COVID-19 vaccine development or distribution.

Inclusive clinical trials. Study participants should reflect groups at risk for COVID-19 to ensure safety and efficacy data are generalizable.

Efficient Distribution. During a pandemic, efficient, expeditious and equitable distribution and administration of approved vaccine is critical.

Flexibility. Within national guidelines, state and local jurisdictions should have flexibility to administer vaccine based on local epidemiology and demand.
ACIP COVID-19 Vaccine Work Group: Proposed Guiding Principles

**Efficient Distribution.** During a pandemic, efficient, expeditious and equitable distribution and administration of authorized vaccine is critical.

**Flexibility.** Within national guidelines, state and local jurisdictions should have flexibility to administer vaccine based on local epidemiology and demand.
Feasibility

Adults ≥65 years

- **Challenge**: long distances to central clinics and high throughput of clinics
- Older adults report high intent to receive COVID-19 vaccine
- Physician offices, pharmacies and public health clinics are established providers of adult vaccination
- Population surveys report 73% - 82% of respondents supported priority vaccination of persons aged ≥65 years/elderly in polls conducted in December 2020 \(^{2,3}\)

Feasibility

Essential workers

- **Challenge**: reaching workers in rural locations, shift workers, those working multiple jobs or working in small cohorts
- Jurisdiction approaches include on site occupational clinics/pharmacies/Health Dept POD strike teams
- Population surveys report 68% - 87% of respondents supported prioritization of early allocation of COVID-19 vaccine supply to essential workers (eg. police/fire/rescue and teachers)¹⁻³

---

Feasibility

Adults with high-risk medical conditions

- **Challenges**: determining eligibility & very large group
- Healthcare homes, such as physician offices or pharmacies, could be better suited to verifying underlying medical conditions
- Population surveys report 68% - 84% of respondents supported prioritization of early allocation of COVID-19 vaccine supply to persons who are high risk because of medical problems

Ethics

Science

Implementation

Ethics
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethical Principle</th>
<th>Age 75+ years (21M)</th>
<th>Age 65-74 Years (32M)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Maximize benefits and minimize harms</td>
<td>Reduces morbidity and mortality in persons with <strong>highest</strong> burden of COVID-19 hospitalization and death</td>
<td>Reduces morbidity and mortality in persons with <strong>high</strong> burden of COVID-19 hospitalization and death</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Promote justice                      | - Will require focused outreach to those who experience barriers to access healthcare  
- Persons living in multi-generational households may have greater risk of exposure |                                                                                     |
| Mitigate Health inequities           | - Racial and ethnic minority groups under-represented among adults >65  
- Racial and ethnic minority persons >65 disproportionate COVID-19 related hospitalization and death |                                                                                     |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethical Principle</th>
<th>Essential Workers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Maximize benefits and minimize harms</strong></td>
<td>Frontline essential workers (~30 M) / Other essential workers (~57M)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| - Essential Workers are at high risk of exposure. Prevention of disease will reduce transmission.  
  - Preserves services essential to the COVID-19 response and overall functioning of society. “Multiplier effect” | |
| **Promote justice**                    | Workers unable to work from home  
  - High level of interaction with public or others in the workplace  
  - May be unable to control social distancing  
  - Frequently interact with others in the workplace | |
| **Mitigate Health inequities**         | Racial and ethnic minority groups disproportionately represented in many essential industries  
  - ~1/4 of essential workers live in low-income families | |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethical Principle</th>
<th>Persons 16-64 with high-risk medical conditions (&gt;110 Million)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Maximize benefits and minimize harms</td>
<td>Reduces morbidity and mortality in persons with <strong>moderate to high</strong> burden of COVID-19 associated hospitalization and death</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promote justice</td>
<td>Will require focused outreach to those with limited or no access to healthcare</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Mitigate Health inequities               | -Increased prevalence of some medical conditions in race/ethnic minority groups & persons in rural areas  
                                           -Diagnosis of medical conditions requires access to healthcare |
Summary of Work Group Considerations
Summary: Work Group considerations

- Scientific, implementation and ethical considerations support inclusion of groups in Phase 1b and 1c as a balance of prevention of morbidity and mortality and preservation of societal functions.
- This represents an interim Phase 1 sequence—allocation policy will need to be dynamic and adapt as new information such as vaccine performance and supply and demand become clear.
- Gating criteria will be necessary to move expeditiously from one Phase to the next, if supply exceeds demand.
- Following vaccination, measures to stop the possible spread of SARS-CoV-2, such as masks and social distancing, will still be needed.
- The U.S. government is committed to making COVID-19 vaccines available to all residents, as soon as possible.
## Proposed Phase 1 & 2 allocation, December 2020

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase</th>
<th>Groups recommended for vaccination</th>
<th>Number of persons in each group (millions)</th>
<th>Number of unique* persons in each group (millions)</th>
<th>Total* (millions)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1a</td>
<td>Health care personnel</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Long-term care facility residents</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1b</td>
<td>Frontline essential workers</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Persons aged 75 years and older</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1c</td>
<td>Persons aged 66+4 years</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Persons aged 16-64 years with high-risk conditions</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>81</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Essential workers not recommended in Phase 1b</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>All people aged 16 years and older not in Phase 1, who are recommended for vaccination</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Accounts for persons recommended in prior phases or overlap within a phase*
## Proposed Phase 1 & 2 allocation, December 2020

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase</th>
<th>Groups recommended for vaccination</th>
<th>Number of persons in each group (millions)</th>
<th>Number of unique* persons in each group (millions)</th>
<th>Total* (millions)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1a</td>
<td>Health care personnel</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Long-term care facility residents</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1b</td>
<td>Frontline essential workers</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Persons aged 75 years and older</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1c</td>
<td>Persons aged 65-74 years</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Persons aged 16-64 years with high-risk conditions</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>81</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Essential workers not recommended in Phase 1b</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>All people aged 16 years and older not in Phase 1, who are recommended for vaccination</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Accounts for persons recommended in prior phases or overlap within a phase
Example of Phase 1 & Phase 2 COVID-19 vaccination roll-out
Proposed Phases of COVID-19 Vaccination

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase 1a</th>
<th>Phase 1b</th>
<th>Phase 1c</th>
<th>Phase 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>16-64 years with high-risk medical conditions (&gt;110M)</td>
<td>16-64 years Without high-risk medical conditions (&lt;86M)</td>
<td>Essential Workers</td>
<td>HTCP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65-74 years (32M)</td>
<td>Frontline</td>
<td>HCP</td>
<td>LTCF</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As an update to ACIP recommendations for vaccination in Phase 1a (health care personnel, and long-term care facility residents), if COVID-19 vaccine supply is limited, the following groups should be offered vaccination:

**Phase 1b**: persons aged ≥75 years and frontline essential workers

**Phase 1c**: persons aged 65–74 years, persons aged 16–64 years with high-risk medical conditions, and other essential workers
Thank you

The findings and conclusions in this report are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent the official position of the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention.