Advertising

The (advertising) campaign is a tool to frame the debate. It can introduce an issue and create ‘noise.’ This not only sparks dialogue but can itself become the environment.

— Anne Miller, Arnold Worldwide
Massachusetts Tobacco Control Program

Advertising is a way to speak to your audience. It’s a communication tactic. For example, if you want people who use tobacco to quit, you need to give them a reason to do—so, something in exchange for giving up their perceived benefits of smoking—the nicotine high or the feeling of independence. Advertising is one way to present, in a clear and persuasive manner, the benefits of quitting tobacco use.

If you think of a tobacco counter-marketing campaign as a conversation, advertising, like public relations, is about how you do the talking. In public relations, the message is delivered through an intermediary, such as the press. In advertising, the message is delivered directly to a mass audience. With public relations, the message may change, depending on who relays it. In advertising, the audience is exposed repeatedly to the same ad. In public relations, you gain the credibility of an intermediary, but you give up a lot of control. In advertising, you don’t benefit from an intermediary’s credibility, but you can more tightly craft the tone and content of your message, as well as when, where, and how often people hear it. You pay a premium for this control, however, when you produce an ad or make a media buy.

Effective advertising can increase knowledge, correct myths, change attitudes, and even help to influence behavior. For example, Florida launched a major teen-oriented mass media campaign aimed at revealing the manipulative
### What Advertising Can and Can’t Do

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Can</th>
<th>Can’t</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>■ Communicate a message</td>
<td>■ Substitute for strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>■ Reach many people</td>
<td>■ Present complicated information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>■ Change attitudes</td>
<td>■ Provide feedback</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>■ Create an image for the campaign</td>
<td>■ Provide services</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

and deceptive tactics of the tobacco industry. After six months, more teens felt strongly that the tobacco industry wanted them to begin smoking to replace dying smokers. A year into the campaign, tobacco use by middle school and high school students in the state declined considerably, in part because advertising had changed their attitudes about cigarettes and tobacco companies.

For advertising to work, however, it must meet the following minimal criteria:

- Offer members of the target audience a benefit they value, thus influencing them to change their beliefs, attitudes, and behaviors
- Reach the target audience enough times that the message is understood and internalized
- Engage audience members in a way that they can understand and that makes them feel understood

Although most effective advertising is created by advertising agencies—firms that specialize in analyzing audiences and finding creative ways to reach them—the counter-marketing program manager doesn’t simply pay the bills and sign off on what the agency does. As with any program approach, the manager must ensure that the ads are more than just entertaining or informative. The program manager must make sure that the ads further the program’s overall objectives and that the three minimal criteria are met. Furthermore, the manager must make sure these efforts are accomplished within a set budget and time frame. This chapter takes you step by step through the four key aspects of managing a successful advertising campaign: logistics, strategy, creative (advertising concepts), and exposure.

**Logistics: Hiring and Managing Advertising Contractors**

Campaigns that rely solely on public service announcements are unlikely to reach a target audience with sufficient regularity to make an impact because they air during time slots donated by the TV or radio stations, so most states hire contractors to create new advertising,
to buy the media needed to place the ads, or to perform both tasks. Some state tobacco control programs with limited emphasis on paid advertising may not need to hire an ad agency, social marketing firm, or media buyer, but states that plan to make advertising a significant part of their overall tobacco control program probably do. Even states planning to use creative materials produced by others will need to make a media buy, and they’re likely to get a better price and more effective placements if they hire professionals to do the buying.

Once a contractor is hired, the challenges are far from over. A counter-marketing manager and the creative agency should set up guidelines for everything from schedules for payment to the process for approving creative materials. Then, during the day-to-day management of the campaign, the counter-marketing manager and the agency must balance the agency’s need for creative freedom with the marketing manager’s need for strategic control. It’s no easy task.

**Selecting Marketing Contractors**

Hiring an agency, media buyer, or social marketing firm is often the first challenge a counter-marketing manager must face. The typical first step is writing a request for proposals (RFP) or a similar document. The rules about writing RFPs vary by state, but one simple way to start is to look at what others have done. People who write RFPs usually review previous RFPs for government-run marketing campaigns in their state (e.g., a lottery or tourism effort) and for counter-marketing campaigns in other states. (See the State Information Forum Web site of the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention at http://ntcp.forum.cdc.gov for sample RFPs.) Take the language that is most relevant to the challenges you face, and refine it to fit your situation. The RFP should provide potential bidders with specific objectives, a description of the behavior you want to change, a list that ranks the target audiences, and a statement of your potential budget.

Most counter-marketing programs use selection committees to choose firms for creative services. A state agency can be protected from the appearance of favoritism by asking a multidisciplinary group of highly respected experts to make a recommendation or to select the marketing contractor on the basis of a thorough review of the proposals submitted and oral presentations. This approach also adds a degree of buy-in from the committee members and brings needed expertise to the decision-making process. There’s no perfect recipe for a selection committee, but most states include marketing and advertising experts, grassroots tobacco control activists, policy makers, health professionals, an evaluation expert, and representatives from the organization managing the campaign. (See Chapter 6: Managing and Implementing Your Counter-Marketing Program for more information on the RFP process.)

Ultimately, the process should help ensure hiring of a firm that can understand your target audience, be responsive to your program’s
needs, offer breakthrough creative ideas, maximize exposure to the message, and be accountable for its use of government funds. Try to stay focused on these goals throughout the selection process. Firms that provide creative services are in the business of making things appealing. Part of your job is to make sure that an advertising approach—no matter how funny or interesting it may be—offers a logical, research-based strategy that fits within the approach of your overall program.

Ask three key questions about firms making a pitch:

1. **Are they strategic?** Do they have a clear idea about how their plan will help to encourage changes in attitudes and behaviors, not just build awareness or interest people in the topic? Do their examples of previous work reflect sound strategic thinking and positive, data-based outcomes?

2. **Are they capable?** Do they and their partners have the ability to produce breakthrough, memorable ads that can help to change beliefs and attitudes and to encourage changes in behavior? Can they manage the media buys you might want? Can they handle the financial responsibilities required by the state? Do they have sufficient staff to service your needs?

3. **Are they listening to you, to the audience, to the research?** Will they be responsive and incorporate data and expert perspectives into their plans?

---

*Most of your interactions will be with Account Services; they will facilitate your interactions with the other core service areas.*
Managing a Marketing Contractor

To manage an advertising agency, it’s helpful to understand how agencies make money and how they handle the work you request. Most ad agencies offer these core services:

- **Account service (also known as client service).** All ad agencies have specialists who are responsible for responding to your needs and managing the work the agency is doing for you. The account service staff are your day-to-day link to the agency.

- **Creative.** An agency’s creative services staff develop a range of advertising products, from TV spots to logos to billboards. Advertising concepts, typically called “creative,” are developed by a copywriter and an art director. The staff, called “creatives,” work on many accounts and are assigned to your projects by the account staff, as needed.

- **Account planning.** Most ad agencies have in-house experts who conduct and analyze market research, then help to develop an overall strategy. Account planners are experts on the consumer, and they provide the creatives with insights to help in development of advertising ideas. Some agencies do not have an account planning department, but have a market research department that focuses on conducting and analyzing research.

- **Media.** Agencies can buy media time or space for you, either in-house or through a subcontract with a media buyer. They keep abreast of current rates and negotiate for TV and radio time, newspaper and magazine space, outdoor advertising, and other opportunities to place your message before the audience. They offer expertise in finding cost-effective ways to reach specific audiences by selecting the best places to run your advertising and negotiating the best rates for these media placements. Some agencies hire another firm that specializes in media buying to handle this work.

- **Production.** Agencies often have in-house staff who produce materials, manage outside vendors, and help them to produce broadcast spots and other advertising.

When you contract directly with an ad agency, you hire a firm whose core business is to create and disseminate advertising products, typically print ads, billboards, and broadcast spots, based on a strategy the agency develops or helps to develop. The agency makes money by charging for creating the product, buying the media time, or both. Most agencies are paid through one or more of the following arrangements:

- **Commission.** A percentage of the media buy and, in some cases, production costs.

- **Project fee.** A straight fee paid for a specific set of deliverables (Partial payments may be made as deliverables are completed.)
- **Retainer.** A fee, typically paid monthly, for a specified scope of work (Sometimes there’s a guaranteed retainer and the possibility of additional charges based on the workload for a particular month.)

- **Time and materials.** A payment system consisting of an hourly rate for labor; a number by which the hourly rates are multiplied (“multiplier”) to underwrite overhead; and direct reimbursement of other expenses (e.g., production costs and the media buy)

- **Performance based.** Compensation related to outcomes (For example, a portion of the payment may be based on the level of confirmed audience awareness of the advertising.)

The government rarely compensates agencies on the basis of results. However, such compensation is becoming more common in the private sector and some states are using performance-based compensation for tobacco control efforts. Florida, for example, hired a compensation consultant to help link the ad agency’s multiplier to awareness, attitude, and behavior measures selected by the state’s Tobacco Pilot Program. In Florida, Minnesota, and other states, the agencies have been guaranteed a base multiplier and growth of the multiplier that is contingent on achievement of certain targets.

Responses to the RFP often recommend the reimbursement arrangement as part of a cost proposal. In some states, an ad agency is selected and then the arrangement for reimbursement is negotiated from scratch, according to applicable state policies. Whatever your state’s policy is, the best approach is to create an arrangement that allows the agency to make a reasonable profit by creating and placing strategically sound, memorable, insightful communication products for your target audience. The ad firm should be rewarded in particular for contributing to desired changes in the audience’s awareness, knowledge, attitudes, intentions, and behaviors.

A good marketing manager should support the agency in ways that will help its creative staff develop the most effective communication products possible, while maintaining appropriate financial and creative control. How can you do that?

- Establish guidelines early.
- Designate a primary contact.
- Trust the creative expertise you hire.
- Tap expertise, not just opinions.
- Protect the agency from politics.
- Agree to brief, written copy strategies.

**Establish guidelines early.** If both the program manager and the ad agency know what to expect, management is always easier. States have established all types of guidelines to ensure that expectations are clear. Two of the most important guidelines relate to approval of creative materials and media buys. You should decide with the contractor how long these approvals will take, who will be involved, and how revisions will be handled. Make these decisions in advance of the first recommendations from
the ad agency, not as the ad development process takes place. Then you need to hold up your end of the bargain: Don't promise five-day approvals if you can't deliver. Also, you should think in terms of the entire process. If you plan to require pretesting, schedule it. In addition, consider developing guidelines for media buying and billing. Media-buying guidelines set rules for what types of media and what kind of exposure the firm should buy. Billing guidelines create deadlines and other restrictions for prompt and accurate billing and payment. You also may want to consider placing limits on the agency's scope of work. For example, you may want to restrict a firm hired at the state level from soliciting additional tobacco control business—and more money—from your partners at the local level.

**Designate a primary contact.** Just as an ad agency assigns specific account staff to your program, the state must assign a primary contact for the agency. This person should coordinate everything the ad agency is asked to do, so the agency isn't pulled in several directions at once. This state staff person should have the ability to make decisions and represent the needs of the overall program.

**Trust the creative expertise you hire.** Outstanding advertising is rarely the result of endless tinkering or a lengthy approval process. Instead, it results from strong strategic planning that uses audience insights, creativity, and judgment. Once a creative agency is carefully selected and hired, marketing managers need to place some trust in the agency. If an agency is hired for its ability to connect with “hip” teens, for example, a middle-aged health department official probably shouldn't question the choice of colors for a youth-targeted flier. On the other hand, don't hesitate to question whether an ad concept will be understood, will be perceived as relevant, will seem credible, or is consistent with your program's goals. These are questions you may want to test with audience research. Using qualitative research, you can expose your target audience to a concept and analyze their reaction. (See Chapter 3: Gaining and Using Target Audience Insights for more information on performing qualitative research.)

**Tap expertise, not just opinions.** Your advertising doesn't need to work for everyone reviewing the ad; it needs to work only for the target audience. As you share a product with your peers and superiors, try to tap their expertise, not their taste. For example, ask the disease expert if the disease references are accurate, not whether he or she “liked” the ad. Consider allowing as many final decisions as possible to be made by the marketing manager, not a more senior political appointee. Some states have allowed a properly tested TV spot to air on the sole basis of a marketing director's approval. You must balance issues of control and accountability with an agency's ability to create something new, insightful, interesting, and effective.

**Protect the agency from politics.** Policy makers are very important in tobacco control, but they may not always be the best marketers. As much as possible, avoid pressuring your agency to make advertising decisions based on
a politician’s preferences. Many creative firms are very client oriented and may respond to political pressures that could be better handled by the secretary of health or another ally. Your ad agency should never be asked to lobby the legislature for funding, nor should a legislator lobby the ad agency to, for example, select for the campaign a certain celebrity who may not appeal to the audience. Many program managers inform policy makers that key marketing decisions should be made by the marketing staff because they are closest to the audience research and are skilled at interpreting it. The marketing manager has a responsibility to ensure that advertising decisions are not based on politics but on marketing information—insights about what might influence the audience and get results. On the other hand, the marketing manager should communicate regularly with state officials who make funding decisions, so they understand the campaign and will not be alienated, surprised, or offended by the ads they see, hear, or read.

Agree to brief, written copy strategies. Keeping on strategy is one of the greatest challenges of any advertising campaign. Advertising is full of creative people eager to break through the media clutter with something new and exciting. Your job, however, is to change behavior and build support for policies, not to win advertising awards or please everyone. You and the agency need to agree—in writing—on what kinds of messages will affect attitudes in a way that will lead to behavior change. Write a brief copy strategy that clearly and simply states what you’re trying to do, and check everything you do against this written agreement. For each new advertising assignment, you and the agency will develop a “creative brief” that describes in detail what you are trying to achieve with each ad or campaign. This brief should include your copy strategy and more details. (See Appendix 6.3: Elements of a Creative Brief and Appendices 6.4, 6.5, and 6.6 for sample creative briefs.) By requiring all your advertising to fall under a copy strategy, you may decide not to produce some very entertaining ads, but what you do produce will be more effective.

The bottom line in logistics is to make it as easy as possible for your creative agency to develop effective advertising. As a marketing manager, you’re not only an agency’s client—you and the agency are partners.

**Strategy: Developing Effective Messages**

Just as your program must have an underlying logic to it, so must your advertising. As with your entire program, your advertising strategy should be based partly on a situational analysis—an understanding of the environment in which you operate. Who is your competition? What are they doing? How is your product—the behavior you’re seeking—viewed in the marketplace? One simple type of situational analysis marketers use is a list of the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats (SWOTs) surrounding the campaign’s goals. This analysis should help you to understand the current situation, so you have a clearer idea about what must change.
In *Principles of Marketing*, Kotler and Armstrong (2001) discuss two elements of advertising strategy: messages and media. A message should be designed to change an attitude or tell people something they don’t already know. Media—TV, radio, newspapers, billboards, or some other outlet—are the channels used to expose people to the message. (See the Creative and Exposure sections later in this chapter for information about choosing media.)

**The Message**

What makes a tobacco control message effective? This is a hot topic debated among the tobacco control community. No single message can claim to be the silver bullet for every audience in every state. Perhaps the most effective messages have yet to be developed, but some messages have already shown promise with at least one type of audience. Several message strategies are commonly used in tobacco control. You should test messages with your audiences before you decide whether your assumptions about what might work are correct. The brief descriptions here may help you to decide on the messages that are worth testing with the audiences you select for your state program.

**Health effects.** The oldest and most obvious appeal in tobacco control is the argument that tobacco is bad for your health. It’s the message the Surgeon General’s warning carries on every pack of cigarettes. Messages range in intensity: some emphasize death, and others focus on sickness. The message can come as statistics, graphics, pictures, personal testimonials, or a combination of these forms. What makes the messages similar is the underlying logic: Health effect messages try to communicate, and often dramatize, the health risks of smoking or chewing tobacco. Some messages on health effects focus on the long term (having a shorter life or an agonizing death) while others focus on the short term (health effects suffered while one is young). Although their logic may seem counterintuitive, some researchers argue...
that for many smokers, especially teens and young adults, the idea of living with the effects of smoking is more frightening than the thought of dying from them.

The approach that emphasizes health effects is criticized by some people as ineffective. They argue that even though most people today know tobacco is unsafe, many still smoke. However, health concerns are probably what led to the substantial drop in cigarette use after the first Surgeon General’s report on smoking and health, in 1964. Health concerns also probably led to the subsequent decline in smoking after the “Fairness Doctrine” advertising from 1967 through 1970, which broadly communicated tobacco’s health effects for the first time (USDHHS 1989). Today it’s important to present health-risk information that is new or that comes from a novel, insightful perspective. One example of this approach is California’s recent campaign linking tobacco use to impotence. The new information in this campaign alarmed some men and caused them to think about their tobacco use differently. Another example is the “Every Cigarette Is Doing You Damage” campaign from Australia. The campaign was aired in six countries, and data from follow-up research supported the effectiveness of the campaign in at least five of those countries. In this campaign, graphic visuals of a rotting lung, a brain with a blood clot, a clogged artery, and a developing tumor were coupled with the news that every cigarette smoked can contribute to similar damage. Other examples of the health effects approach are the testimonial ads developed and aired by many states and other countries. These ads poignantly describe the physical and emotional tolls that tobacco has taken on real-life smokers and their families, in the words of those individuals. The ads personalize the health effects and make them relevant to smokers and their friends and families. One caveat when using the health effects approach is that people sometimes don’t believe dramatizations that are overexaggerated or are too removed from what they see every day or what they can imagine.

**Secondhand smoke.** Perhaps the most widely used strategy today focuses on the dangers of

---

1 The Fairness Doctrine was an agreement within the broadcast industry to air one antitobacco message for every three protobacco advertisements aired. As a result, significant levels of media presence for tobacco counter-advertising messages were reached for the first time for long enough to achieve a high level of awareness.
exposure to secondhand smoke. For more than a decade, counter-marketing programs across the country have communicated and dramatized the health effects of secondhand smoke on nonsmokers—to encourage smokers to protect their loved ones, discourage smoking in public places, and support policy initiatives, such as smokefree workplaces. California relied heavily on these types of messages in its successful push to support some of the nation's strongest statewide tobacco control policies, such as smokefree bars and restaurants. These messages encourage nonsmokers to question a behavior that decades of tobacco advertising have tried to frame as a norm. Secondhand smoke messages also have been found to encourage smoking cessation because smokers have fewer places to smoke, fewer people will permit a smoker to light up around them, and fewer smokers want to smoke around friends and family. The strategy also counters the tobacco industry's claim that smoking is an “individual choice.”

Industry manipulation. This strategy aims to reveal to potential and current smokers how the tobacco industry uses manipulative and deceptive practices to win new customers and maintain current ones, regardless of the health consequences. These messages often talk about the industry's advertising tactics, profit motives, history of targeting children, and efforts to downplay or simply deny the health dangers of smoking. One common message is that the industry targets teens as “replacement smokers” to take the place of smokers who have died. An early California ad using this approach is one of the most memorable TV spots the state tobacco control program has ever produced.

Repositioning. Aimed at teens, this approach is a close cousin of industry manipulation, but its messages are part of a larger strategy that not only repositions the tobacco industry as a manipulative adult institution, but also gives tobacco control advocates an opportunity to take on the role of hip rebels. The goal is to undermine two benefits offered by cigarette brands popular with teens—rebellion and independence—and to offer those benefits to nonsmokers. Florida took this approach by creating and branding an edgy, rebellious anti-tobacco effort called “truth.” Although teens actually played a large role in directing the campaign, much of the work and development needed to be performed by the health department and its contractors. By making the campaign appear to be organized entirely by hip teens, however, this effort repositioned the “truth” movement, and thus nonsmoking, as young and hip, while making smoking seem old and corporate. This strategy is now the basis of the national “truth” campaign funded by the American Legacy Foundation.

Defining the norm. Because most people don’t smoke, some programs use the “follow-the-crowd” approach to let people know that smokers are in the minority. One TV spot, for example, informed teens that three of four teenagers don’t smoke. The theory is that teens sometimes consider smoking because they think everyone is doing it. They’re conforming to a perceived social norm. These messages
simply deflate the myth that “everyone is doing it.” In addition, showing that non-smokers are the majority may empower them to speak up about secondhand smoke. On the other hand, critics of this approach worry that some independent and more rebellious teens might be attracted to smoking, because most people don’t do it.

**Social consequences.** Messages on social consequences consider how tobacco use might affect a person’s social standing, dating opportunities, and other situations. Although teens are concerned with social consequences, messages from state health departments about social consequences in the teen culture face the same credibility challenges that parents of teens often face. One tactic to address this challenge is featuring older and seemingly hip teens as spokespeople, which gives them an authentic voice. Some states are also beginning to look at the social consequences in a global sense, considering tobacco’s impact on issues such as child labor, the environment, and poverty in the developing world.

**Chemical disclosure.** Another strategy is to tell people about the chemicals in cigarette smoke or about the hundreds of chemical additives in cigarettes. This advertising typically tries to dramatize the implications of being exposed to the deadly chemicals known to be associated with smoking. One TV spot showed a family drinking these chemicals from beakers. Another ad interviewed professionals who worked with toxic chemicals and used protective clothing to shield themselves from those chemicals. The message highlighted their shock that the same chemicals were found in secondhand smoke inhaled every day by many people, who are unprotected from its effects.

**Addiction.** Several programs have attempted to illustrate the power of nicotine addiction: Once someone decides to smoke, that decision isn’t always easy to reverse. One difficulty with this strategy is the message it sends to current smokers. After hearing these messages, some smokers may believe cessation attempts are hopeless. Making the addiction claim convincing for youth also has been a challenge. In focus groups, even teens who acknowledge that nicotine is addictive don’t always seem to understand what that means. “Once I feel I’m getting addicted,” one teen said, “I’ll quit.” An addiction message may be better used to supplement another message. For example,
addiction has been mentioned in industry manipulation to emphasize how tobacco companies recruit “customers for life.” The power of addiction also is noted often in smoking cessation messages.

**Heroes and celebrities.** Many tobacco control ads use famous actors, musicians, models, and athletes in the same way that commercial brands use these celebrities: to associate the product (i.e., the behavior of not smoking) with someone who is loved and admired. These heroes and celebrities have included supermodel Christy Turlington, actor Esai Morales, the musical group Boyz II Men, and the national women’s soccer team. Celebrities can also attract news media. However, it’s important to carefully select the heroes and celebrities to use as spokespeople, because working with them can have downsides. They can quickly fall from popularity, may suddenly become bad role models by adopting the behaviors you’re trying to change in the target audience, may command significant fees, and often demand a lot of creative control.

**Role models.** Another strategy focuses on how adults and older teens are role models themselves, most commonly to their children and younger siblings, respectively. The essential message is that if you decide to smoke, others will follow. One ad shows a couple peering into their bedroom, where their children are playing dress up and are pretending to be adults. The couple is aghast when they see the children pretend to smoke, copying their behavior. This approach has been used with populations such as African Americans, Asians, and Hispanics/Latinos in which family connections are often very important. Counter-marketing programs have also used the role model theme to promote tobacco control advocacy. The “truth” campaign, both in Florida and nationally, under the American Legacy Foundation, showed teens taking a stand against tobacco advertising. One Florida ad featured teens ripping tobacco ads from magazines. Another ad, developed by Massachusetts, told the story of a group of teens who pressured a mall to go smokefree.

**Cosmetic effects.** Like messages about social consequences, messages about the effects of tobacco use are more about appearance than health. Put simply, tobacco use can be disgusting. Messages about cosmetic effects rely on people’s concern about their appearance. By dramatizing consequences such as yellow teeth or cigarette breath, such messages tell an audience that tobacco makes them less appealing. Some messages emphasize the results of these effects: A Massachusetts ad shows an attractive teenage girl talking about how smokers turn her off. However, experts debate the efficacy of this approach. In focus groups, teens often say they can mask these effects of cigarettes with perfume, with breath mints, or in some other way.

**Refusal skills or individual choice.** Campaigns centered on refusal skills or individual choice, which nearly always target youth, typically show a teenager or group of teenagers discussing their own decisions not to smoke. These ads try to build credibility by appearing to respect a teen’s ability to make an individual choice about tobacco use. Philip Morris
(now renamed as Altria), the maker of the nation’s most popular cigarette, Marlboro, created the largest and best known individual choice campaign, which carried the tag line: “Think. Don’t Smoke.” Qualitative and quantitative research on ads from that campaign showed that those ads didn’t perform as well as ads from tobacco control campaigns using other approaches. Qualitative research demonstrated that individual choice ads developed by state programs did not perform well either. Survey respondents thought that giving youth the choice to smoke without giving them good rationale for not smoking (e.g., information on health effects) was not a strong or helpful message and would cause some youth to choose to smoke. (More information about the quantitative research is available from the American Legacy Foundation’s First Look Report 9, Getting to the Truth: Assessing Youths’ Reactions to the “truth” and “Think. Don’t Smoke” Tobacco Countermarketing Campaigns (2002).

Smoking cessation. A number of messages have been used to encourage people to quit smoking or call a hotline to help them quit. Many use the messages described earlier with a twist that will appeal to certain smokers, such as telling parents about the dangers to their children of secondhand smoke or graphically exposing for pack-a-day smokers the health effects of their smoking. In some cases, ads to promote smoking cessation emphasize the health benefits of quitting as opposed to the dangers of continued use of tobacco. Also, cessation ads sometimes focus on efficacy, recognizing that it is difficult but very possible to stop smoking. Occasionally, these ads offer tips on how to quit. The most successful cessation ads nearly always include an easy-to-remember number for quitline services that are supported by well-qualified staff.

By jointly agreeing to a copy strategy with your creative agency, you have logic against which to judge particular advertising products. One way to do this is to determine which strategies are likely to work best, test them with your audience, and then select the strategy that seems the most powerful. Try to capture the approach in a short and simple statement, perhaps a single sentence. For example, a statement that sets direction for a secondhand smoke ad could say:

To increase support from nonsmokers for restrictions on tobacco use in homes and public places, we will show nonsmokers how secondhand smoke endangers them.

An ad focused solely on the health dangers to smokers, as opposed to nonsmokers, would be off strategy when it comes to this objective. It might be interesting and even frightening to nonsmokers, but a message that smoking is dangerous for smokers isn’t based on the logic of the message strategy on secondhand smoke. If you don’t stick to your strategy, you’re not giving the strategy you developed a chance to work.

You may have several copy strategies aimed at different audiences, but try not to create too many for each audience. Too many messages aimed at the same audience can have the result that no single message reaches the audience
Designing and Implementing an Effective Tobacco Counter-Marketing Campaign

enough times to make a difference. Attitudes are changed only after people are repeatedly exposed to the same basic message. To stick to the strategy without wearing out a particular ad or message, you’ll probably want to illustrate the same message in different ways. You can produce or reuse different creative executions that carry the same basic message. You may want to use various media vehicles (communication channels), knowing they’ll work synergistically to strengthen the message’s impact. A vehicle is a route or method used to reach a target audience with a message. Examples of media vehicles are TV, radio, the Internet, bus signs, billboards, brochures, and notepads in physicians’ offices.

**Context of the Message**

You should also consider the context of your message. You’re not the only one talking to your audience. Your target audiences are being exposed to hundreds of messages every
day. Some may directly pertain to tobacco. Others may not mention tobacco, but still may influence what your audience thinks is right, fashionable, or simply believable. These other messages will affect how the audience receives your message.

People consider information from many sources when they form opinions. Your audience may already be hearing from the tobacco industry, voluntary health organizations (e.g., the American Cancer Society), and the American Legacy Foundation, which is the antitobacco foundation created by the national settlement with the tobacco industry. Each campaign may have a different message, and your target audience may not recall who is saying what. For example, your audience may think the state health department’s antitobacco program and the Philip Morris youth smoking prevention effort are the same campaign.

You can’t coordinate everyone’s messages, but you can consider how your effort might fit. For example, Legacy’s “truth” campaign is spending heavily to reach teens and young adults with industry manipulation and repositioning messages. Instead of competing for teens’ attention, you could choose to support this strategy, not with additional ads but with on-the-ground marketing efforts, such as the creation of youth antitobacco groups or “collateral materials” (promotional and other items such as T-shirts, posters, and fliers) to be used by interested teens. (See Chapter 10: Grassroots Marketing for more about promoting youth activism.) Or you may choose to target adults with messages that focus on changing norms around secondhand smoke or on cessation, both of which are likely to contribute to lower youth tobacco use over time.

**Creative: Breaking Through the Clutter**

Once you’ve explored various message strategies for the target audience and determined the one you believe has the most potential to influence the audience as desired, you’ll begin working toward creative development of ads. Instead of developing ads, you may decide to save time and resources and reapply previously produced ads from other states, organizations, or countries. Although some parts of this section are relevant both to ad reapplication and developing new ads (for example, the process you will go through in critiquing ads), this section focuses mainly on topics relevant ONLY to developing new advertising. It’s not an easy task to effectively translate your chosen message strategy into creative concepts and then to produce ads based on those concepts. This task requires a high level of strategic discipline and teamwork between you and the ad agency, with all parties contributing their talents to the effort.

In advertising, details matter as much as message strategy. Two TV spots might share the same message strategy and even the same script but may be executed very differently. Who is talking and how they present themselves will affect the impact of the final ad. Is this a message from the band 98 Degrees or from the governor? One might be more credible defining what’s cool to teens; the other might be more credible with parents. Even
Table 7.1: Pros and Cons of Advertising Media

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Format</th>
<th>Pros</th>
<th>Cons</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TV Spots</td>
<td>• Reach a broad audience</td>
<td>• Expensive to air</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Deliver audiovisual impact</td>
<td>• Fleeting exposure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Have a flexible format</td>
<td>• Insufficient time for complex explanations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Typically expensive to produce new ads</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• TV spots are usually 15, 30, or 60 seconds long. Most run 30 seconds. The longer spots are more expensive to air.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radio Spots</td>
<td>• Are cheaper than TV spots</td>
<td>• Audio impact only</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Can typically have a narrower target than TV spots</td>
<td>• Narrow reach per station</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Can be produced quickly</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Are typically longer than TV spots, allowing more complex messages</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Paid radio spots are typically 60 seconds long; public service announcements tend to be 30 seconds long. You can also use live announcer scripts (“live copy ads”).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Print Ads</td>
<td>• Reach a specific audience, often including opinion leaders</td>
<td>• Very short life span</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Have short lead time (newspapers) and immediate impact</td>
<td>• Compete in cluttered advertising environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Youth and people of lower economic status often missed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Print ads run in newspapers, magazines, and student publications and can be one-quarter or one-half page or a full page.</td>
<td>• Long lead time (magazines)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outdoor Ads</td>
<td>• Can reinforce messages placed elsewhere (e.g., TV or radio)</td>
<td>• Limited message space</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Can repeatedly expose commuters to message</td>
<td>• Damage from weather and graffiti</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Can be inexpensive (e.g., transit space)</td>
<td>• Difficult to target narrowly (Everyone will see it.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Can give high exposure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ads include billboards and signs on storefronts, buses, trains, and benches.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 7.1: Pros and Cons of Advertising Media (cont.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Format</th>
<th>Pros</th>
<th>Cons</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Point-of-Purchase Ads</strong></td>
<td>Ads are placed in stores where tobacco is sold.</td>
<td>• Can counter tobacco advertising where the product is bought</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Can be inexpensive to produce</td>
<td>• Difficult to place (Tobacco industry is major point-of-purchase advertiser.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Movie Trailers and Slides</strong></td>
<td>Ads appear in video or still photos shown before a movie begins.</td>
<td>• Target frequent moviegoers (e.g., teens)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Can have high impact and may serve to “inoculate” viewers against images of people smoking in movies</td>
<td>• Production and placement of trailers can be expensive (Production costs can be saved by using an existing TV spot.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Targeting of specific kinds of movies not usually allowed by theaters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Ad trailers not allowed by some film distributors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Print Materials</strong></td>
<td>Many programs use informational brochures; some aim materials at a specific market.</td>
<td>• Can be inexpensive to produce</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Have longer life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Allow large amount of message space</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Not an “interruption” medium. (Target audiences must want to read materials.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Dissemination required</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Possibility of duplicates to the same individuals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Web Banners</strong></td>
<td>“Click-through” banners can link commercial and partner Web sites to a program.</td>
<td>• Broaden exposure on new media</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• “Click-through” rates typically low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Pop-up ads considered annoying distractions by most people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Small message space</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Web Sites</strong></td>
<td>Many programs build Web sites; some sites are aimed at specific audiences.</td>
<td>• Can be relatively inexpensive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Are constantly present</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Have unlimited message area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Can be updated quickly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Need to drive traffic to Web sites</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Compete with a large number of other sites</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Maintenance and monitoring often required</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 7.1: Pros and Cons of Advertising Media (cont.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Format</th>
<th>Pros</th>
<th>Cons</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sponsorships</strong></td>
<td>• Are typically turnkey promotional opportunities in which you can pay for services of staff to handle the event</td>
<td>• Possibly expensive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Associate program’s “brand” with well-liked celebrities, brands, or events</td>
<td>• Perception of negative association by some audiences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Creation of expectation of continued support that may not be possible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• More limited reach than mass media</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Collateral Materials</strong></td>
<td>• Can provide continued but limited exposure to target audience</td>
<td>• Distribution required</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Programs may create promotional materials (e.g., T-shirts, key chains, and refrigerator magnets).</td>
<td>• Benefits people involved in activities</td>
<td>• High cost for limited exposure</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Producing good creative is an art form. Beyond sending a clear message, advertising must be salient and interesting. The audience should feel understood and respected. Advertising can be tested to determine which concepts or finished ads have the highest likelihood of success, but just how it may work in the real world is always partly a mystery. The artistic expertise for which the creative firms are hired must be valued and appreciated, but it also must be balanced with the tobacco control experience and technical expertise that you bring to the process. You are ultimately responsible for ensuring that the ads that are approved have the highest likelihood of contributing to your tobacco control goal.

Managers evaluate potential advertising in different ways. The key is to think broadly and avoid nitpicking any product to meet your personal tastes. If you relate everything to what you know about your audience and your strategy, you can provide the creative firm with the needed perspective. Consider four key questions:

1. **Is the creative product something you can disseminate effectively to your audience?**
   For example, you may not want to produce...
a TV spot if you don't have much money for a media buy; instead, radio might be a more cost-efficient option.

2. **Is the creative product on strategy?** For example, the product shouldn't dwell solely on health effects if your strategy is industry manipulation.

3. **Does the product reflect what you know about your audience?** Think about whether it communicates persuasively to your audience. Will they understand it? Will they feel understood? Is it persuasive? Will the audience respond to the actors in terms of age, diversity, and attitude?

4. **Might unintended negative consequences occur?** Advertising exposure can't be tightly controlled; other audiences will be exposed to these products. Consider the implications of that scenario. For example, teens who view a message aimed at adults about how many teens are smoking might begin to see smoking as the norm.

**Types of Creative**

Work with your creative firm to decide what kinds of products to use. Will billboards work? Should you buy radio time? What about a brochure? Does your budget allow for this advertising? The creative firm should present you with a plan to use several different types of advertising materials in a campaign. The materials should complement one another to completely reach members of your target audience, whether they watch TV, read newspapers, or only see billboards. (See Table 7.1 for a list of the most common types of advertising and the benefits and drawbacks associated with each product.)

Table 7.1 lists only some of the types of advertising available. Advertising messages are placed everywhere these days, from a banner flown above a beach to the well of a urinal. Your job is to determine the most appropriate and cost-efficient place for the audience to see your message, so it's clear, widely viewed, persuasive, and without unintended negative consequences.

You should also consider using creative materials that already exist. Even states with large campaigns that produce a large percentage of their own materials (e.g., California, Florida, and Massachusetts) have borrowed advertising executions from other states and countries. To help states share materials, the CDC Media Campaign Resource Center (MCRC) maintains an inventory of existing tobacco counter-advertising materials developed by a number of states, organizations, and federal agencies. By providing access to existing advertising materials, the resource center allows states, organizations, and government agencies to save the time and high cost of producing new ads. The MCRC collection includes ads for TV, radio, print, and outdoor use that address a variety of themes and target audiences. In addition, the MCRC negotiates rights and talent fees to simplify the process of using the ads in different states. (More information and a searchable database are available on the MCRC Web site, http://www.cdc.gov/tobacco/mcrc).
In general, you’ll want to select vehicles with the lowest cost per thousand audience members potentially reached (CPM). However, CPM should be balanced with the need for high-quality exposure. For example, showing ads to promote smoking cessation in a physician’s waiting room may have a high cost and low overall reach, but the exposures are very high quality, because you have a captive audience consisting of people preparing to talk to their physician about their health.

Pretesting Creative

Advertising can be very expensive. Producing a high-quality, 30-second TV spot by using union talent can easily cost more than $250,000. Airing the spot can cost much, much more, so before major advertisers invest money in airing or placing an ad, they typically test it to determine whether it clearly conveys the intended message.

Pretesting can be performed at several stages in the creative process. You can pretest a concept, a script, a rough cut of a broadcast spot, or a storyboard (visuels and words that portray the actions in a proposed TV spot). (See Appendices 7.2 and 7.3 for sample storyboards.) Also, the finished ad itself can be used in a pretest. Pretesting won’t tell you whether the ad will “work”; you’ll find that out only after you place the ad and measure attitudinal changes or other results in the context of your entire campaign. However, pretesting can give you important information about whether your intended message is being communicated clearly to your target audience. The most common conclusions you can draw from pretesting are:

- **Overall reaction.** How is the ad likely to make the audience feel?
- **Communication of a message.** What message is your audience likely to take away from the ad?
- **Likes and dislikes.** What parts of the ad are likely to please or anger your audience?
- **Confusing aspects.** What parts of the ad are likely to confuse your audience?
- **Credibility.** Is your audience likely to find the ad believable?
- **Relevance.** Does the audience think this is a message for “people like them”? Does it apply to their lives?
- **Perceived motivational aspects.** Is your audience likely to think the ad will prompt them to change anything? Do they find the ad convincing? (Attempting to measure the ad’s potential influence can be very misleading. People don’t like to admit that advertising might affect their behavior. What’s more, the ad may only need to affect an attitude as part of an overall program that will change behavior.)
Some pretesting efforts use larger sample sizes and try to measure people's intention to change behavior. On the opposite extreme, some pretesting can be abbreviated as a qualitative communication check. The testing measures whether the “take-away” (messages and impressions left with the audience after viewing of the ad) was what you intended.

Before you pretest, decide what you need to learn. You need to be realistic about what you can learn and whether you're learning something that can be the basis for some action. Don't ignore the results of your pretesting, but rather use them in your decision making.

As a program manager, you can require your creative firm to pretest (1) some or all of the ads you're considering for use in the counter-marketing campaign, (2) only the ads targeted at a specific group, or (3) only the ads that you believe could pose problems. You can also decide at what stage the testing would be most useful. The testing can be performed by the creative firm, a subcontractor to the creative firm, or another contractor you hire separately. Some people worry that creative firms won't test their own creative products fairly, but good firms know it's to their advantage to honestly pretest their products to find problems before they're widely distributed. You should understand and agree to the testing methods selected. You'll also want to observe the research, if possible, and fully understand the analysis. Firsthand observations will better prepare you to fight for the production of an ad or defend it once it's produced. (See Chapter 3: Gaining and Using Target Audience Insights for more information on pretesting.) You and the agency should be partners in the planning and execution of the research and in drawing conclusions from the results.

Creating a Standard Review Process

The final version of a creative product should not surprise you. A TV spot, magazine ad, or other creative product should be the result of a
joint effort by the creative firm and you. Again, as a program manager, your role is to continually evaluate whether the product is persuasive and on strategy, can be disseminated to your audience, reflects what you know about your audience, and is not likely to cause unintended negative consequences.

You can make these judgments at several points in the creative process. You and your creative firm should agree on when your review is necessary. A list and discussion of the milestones for reviewing a TV spot are provided here. The TV spot is one of the more complicated and costly products a creative firm can produce and place. The process is similar for other creative products, such as print ads and radio spots. You may not have time to perform every step for every creative product, but you and your creative firm can decide jointly when your input would be most valuable.

The milestones are as follows:

- **Read the creative brief.**
- **Review the scripts or storyboards.**
- **Attend pretesting focus groups or interviews.**
- **Attend or listen in on the preproduction meeting.**
- **Attend the shoot.**
- **View the first cut.**
- **View and approve the edited spot.**

**Read the creative brief.** The first thing you should review when overseeing the production of a TV spot is the creative brief. You may even want to be involved in helping write the creative brief. Some ad agencies consider the creative brief to be an internal function of the ad agency, developed by agency planners and account staff, and shared exclusively with the creatives. However, you have the right and responsibility to ensure that it’s strategically focused and communicates the key information and insights the creatives will need to do their work. This is the document that tells the agency’s writers and artists—the people who create the ad—what you want. Because the function of the creative brief is to translate your strategy into specific guidelines for the creative team, you may want to help develop it or at least review it before it goes to the creative staff. (See Appendix 6.3: Elements of a Creative Brief and Appendices 6.4, 6.5, and 6.6 for samples of creative briefs.)

**Review the scripts or storyboards.** After the creative brief is shared with the creatives, they’ll develop ideas for creative executions (e.g., the script or storyboards for a TV spot; see Appendices 7.2 and 7.3 for sample storyboards). The creative executions may be presented to you in a meeting. When you review the script or storyboard and see the intended visuals, think about how your audience might react and whether these creative concepts accomplish what you set out to do in the creative brief. This task won’t always be easy. At first, you may not see how the proposed ad can accomplish your goal. Some advertising executions cannot be interpreted literally. In all cases, the firm should be able to explain how the ad can accomplish...
the goal(s) you set out in the creative brief. (See Appendix 7.1 for help in organizing your comments and questions about the creative concepts.) Raise any concerns you have about taste, language, or how you see the ad taking shape. Are the visuals reinforcing what’s being said? Is the language appropriate and understandable for this audience? Is there anything that might unnecessarily offend the audience or mislead people? As the content expert, you must ensure that the “facts” in the ad are true and can be substantiated.

**Attend pretesting focus groups or interviews.** At this stage, the scripts and storyboards can be presented to members of your target audience to get their reactions. You should observe the pretesting to be sure that the audience understands the messages and finds the ad concepts relevant and clear. If you can’t attend the testing, read the transcripts or the report of the findings, watch the video, or listen to the audiotape. The agency personnel (e.g., account service, research and planning, and creative staff) should also attend the sessions. You may also want other members of your staff to attend. Consider inviting key stakeholders to observe focus groups of specific populations that they represent. Even though these stakeholders share many characteristics with the specific population, they may differ in significant ways (such as education or income), and observing a focus group may help them to better understand the participants.

You may wish to pretest again after production of the TV spot, because storyboards don’t always adequately convey the experience of seeing the finished ad. You can also pretest using animatics or a rough version of a spot or print ad. One caveat is that some creative concepts don’t lend themselves well to focus group testing of a storyboard. For example, an ad that relies on clever special effects or a testimonial ad that relies on the candid emotions of a person negatively affected by tobacco use may not be convincing or engaging in focus groups where those special elements are missing. In these cases, you won’t be able to judge the persuasiveness of the ad concepts, but you still should be able to determine whether the audience understood the messages and found them relevant.

**Attend or listen in on the preproduction meeting.** Shortly before the production of an ad (the shoot), a preproduction meeting is held for the agency’s creative staff to meet with the people who will actually produce the spot. They discuss locations, wardrobe, talent, and other production issues. The meeting is often held where the shoot will take place. If you can’t be there in person, it’s a good idea to join the meeting by phone. Most production decisions are probably best left to the agency and the production crew, but occasionally you may want to address certain issues. For example, you would raise an objection if they were planning something you think might offend the audience or might not be appropriate for your campaign. If you have questions or concerns, don’t be afraid to raise them. It’s much harder to make changes once the shoot is complete.

**Attend the shoot.** Many marketing managers attend the filming of the ad (the shoot), though it’s not a necessity. Your role usually will be limited, but your attendance will be more
important in cases where you need to weigh in on unanticipated issues. For example, Florida and Minnesota developed ads using video of unscripted teens criticizing the industry’s practices. It was important for the marketing manager to be present because the script was essentially being written and approved on the spot.

**View the first cut.** After the shoot and some editing, the agency can show you a rough cut of the production that may not yet include all the edits or production enhancements the creative firm is planning, such as color correction, sound adjustment, sound effects, and music. This step will give you a chance to review the spot before the creative firm invests a lot of time and money in postproduction processes. The agency can tell you what can be changed at this point. If you have concerns about some aspect(s) of the ad, you may also want to test the ad with the target audience to see if your concerns are valid. Sometimes ads are produced and never aired. This may seem wasteful, but it’s smarter than spending a lot more money buying time to air an ineffective or offensive ad that will cause you problems. Many veteran marketers can tell you about an ad that never ran and how happy they are that it didn’t run.

**View and approve the edited spot.** You should always review the version of the spot that you intend to air but try to avoid having to get clearance from a large number of people. Everyone is a critic, and sometimes it’s difficult to remind your superiors that what really matters is how the audience sees the spot, not how it’s viewed inside your department or agency.

In many states, a large number of reviews can’t be avoided. Try to remind every reviewer what the ad is supposed to do and which audience it’s intended to reach. Use the pretesting results to support the relevance of the message to your audience.

In the end, your role in the creative process is one of quality control. You’re not a critic, an editor, or an artist, but you are the person ultimately responsible for ensuring that your advertising is on strategy and effective with the intended audience. You may not even like the ad. That’s okay. You just need to believe it will work.

**Exposure: Show the Message Enough for It to Sink In**

Great advertising is worthless if nobody sees it. A program manager or marketing manager needs to ensure that the right people get the
right message multiple times. You need your target audience to become familiar enough with your message that it raises awareness, changes an attitude, or prompts action. This means they have to see it more than once. Many advertising experts say that, in general, people won’t even remember a commercial unless they’ve seen it at least three times. Others contend that TV spots must be seen three to seven times to be effective. In reality, the success of an ad largely depends on the quality of the creative execution and production. There are no set criteria, but one thing is for sure: Once is not enough.

Advertising is not a vaccine. In a global review of smoking cessation campaigns by CDC and the World Health Organization, successful cessation efforts required both a “strong” and “ongoing” media presence. When levels of advertising drop, so do the calls to cessation helplines. You can expect levels of ad awareness to mirror the schedule of your media buys. Awareness may be high while TV spots are on the air, but it will likely drop once the ads stop running.

You also need to think about when and how you reach your audience. The fact that you can reach the audience with your message at a certain time and through a certain channel does not mean you always should. For example, you might not want to run an ad on breast cancer during a Sunday football game. It’s a bad “aperture” for a media message on breast cancer, because football fans aren’t likely to change their thinking from rooting for a team to considering how the disease might affect them or their spouses. When Florida launched its rebellious youth antitobacco brand, the state could have disseminated its message in schools. After all, where better to reach teens? But the state shunned that dissemination approach. If teachers and principals promoted the “truth” brand, program managers reasoned, it would seem anything but young, cool, and rebellious. The approach would undermine the brand’s value, and in the process, the strategy.

Exposure is usually measured by reach and frequency, which are typically translated into “rating points.” A rating point is the percentage of the target audience potentially reached (reach) multiplied by the number of times the audience will potentially see the message (frequency). If, on the basis of your media buy, 50 percent of the targeted audience is expected to see your ad an average of three times, you’ve purchased 150 target rating points (TRPs). (The term target rating points is meant to convey that the rating points are specifically for your target audience.) Rating points are usually expressed in four-week figures, but you must always ask to be sure. An agency may add rating points together over a longer or shorter period. For example, an agency may talk about buying 1,200 rating points during the launch of your campaign. That statement may mean 300 points a week for four weeks or 150 points over eight weeks.

You may also hear media planners refer to “gross rating points” (GRPs). By definition, both GRPs and TRPs represent the total amount of rating points bought over a period of time in relation to an audience. Typically, a planner will use GRPs or TRPs to represent
rating points for your target audience, not rating points for a general audience, but you need to check to make sure.

Rating points vary depending on which audience is being targeted. For example, “Sabrina the Teenage Witch,” a TV show produced by Warner Bros. Television Network, would have much higher rating points for adolescent girls than for 40-year-old men, and network news would have higher rating points for retirees than for teenagers.

Because buying media is so expensive, programs typically buy media in “flights” of three to six weeks, then go off the air for two to six weeks. If you’re introducing a campaign, you should be on the air as continuously as possible during the first six to 12 months, and that strategy is even more important if you’re trying to establish a brand. Awareness of the campaign will vary depending on how long a flight has been on the air, when it aired (e.g., time of day, season, programs), and how many flights were used over a period of time, but media are typically bought in a way that preserves some baseline level of awareness. Although ads are not on the air constantly, an effort is made to keep the program’s message constantly in people’s minds. The broadcast buy is supplemented by other vehicles, such as outdoor advertising, which is typically bought in month-long increments. These supplemental ads remain in place during the off weeks of a broadcast buy, and broadcast ads return to the airways before a dramatic dip in awareness occurs. You should be given a media flowchart (including dates, TRPs, and markets) that shows how each flight will take place for different audience segments. The media experts at your ad agency can advise you on how to maximize the impact of your budget.

Again, media messages aren’t like inoculations: No audience becomes immune to an unhealthy behavior after a certain number of exposures to a message. Just as Coca-Cola must continue advertising even though the soft drink is very well known, tobacco control programs can’t simply air a message, then disappear. A constant and evolving media program with new and engaging messages is needed to counter the competitive influences on the audience to smoke or chew tobacco.

How much exposure should you buy? That depends on your strategy, the stage of your campaign, the other counter-marketing activities, and your budget. Some strategies require more exposure than others. Some programs depend less on advertising and more on other interventions, such as smoking restrictions, education programs, or cigarette taxes. There’s no one-size-fits-all formula.

Programs generally start with stronger media buys to win the audience’s attention. When California launched the nation’s first major tobacco counter-marketing campaign in 1990, the state was on the air almost continuously from April to November, buying 125 to 175 TRPs a week for adults and about 100 TRPs a week for teens. The program is now very well known inside the state, so media buys usually run three- or four-week flights of 100 to 150 TRPs per week, with breaks that last about a month.
“We have a maintenance level of 100 [TRPs] per week on the major networks,” says Colleen Stevens, the program’s marketing director. “If we have something new, we increase the buy to at least 150 [TRPs]. Admittedly, we’d like to air at higher TRP levels, but our budget doesn’t allow for higher levels.”

In some cases, the best guide to scaling your media buy is doing what commercial marketers with similar strategies do. When Florida decided to base its teen-targeted campaign on the creation of a hip, rebellious antitobacco brand, the state’s ad agency looked at the media buys made during the launch of other youth brands. The state decided on a very aggressive buy, purchasing an average of 244 TRPs a week on TV alone for two months and supplementing this presence with radio ads.

Your creative firm’s media-buying recommendation probably will be based largely on your budget. One reason Florida made such an aggressive buy was that the state could afford it. The state’s tobacco settlement had specifically allocated tens of millions of dollars to the tobacco control program, about one-third of which was invested in marketing. Program staff also knew that many people were watching carefully to see whether the program would succeed.

It’s probably a good idea to buy as much exposure as you can afford. If your strategy is sound, your message is effective, and your creative executions are clear and attention-getting, the only thing standing between your advertising and success is exposure.

Choosing a Media Approach: Paid Media, PSAs, and Earned Media

Typically, the most effective marketing campaigns use multiple communication approaches. This is true for selling soap, persuading drivers to buckle up, or encouraging people not to smoke around others. Paid advertising campaigns, public service announcement (PSA) campaigns, and “earned media” efforts all have advantages and drawbacks, but used in combination, they offer an opportunity to reach audiences with multiple yet complementary messages. In tobacco control, where significant media buys have been taking place for some time, this sort of combination approach is common.

Here’s a look at these three approaches, along with discussions about using them in combination and using only PSAs and earned media when paid campaigns are too expensive.

Conducting a Paid Advertising Campaign

A paid advertising campaign is the most effective communication tool for reaching large audiences with a relatively simple message. It lets you target specific audiences with persuasive messages that can affect a person’s awareness, attitudes, beliefs, and, potentially, behavior.

However, conducting a sustained paid advertising campaign is expensive. Successful paid media campaigns conducted by states have ranged in cost from approximately $.50 to $3.50 per capita a year, and a significant portion of those funds were for paid advertising.
A successful paid advertising campaign has a few key features:

- **Thorough campaign planning.** Before developing a paid media campaign, you must completely understand the members of your target audience, the messages that influence them, and how to reach them. You should outline the specific objectives you want to achieve and then determine which audiences, messages, and media vehicles are most appropriate for reaching those objectives.

- **Sufficient budget to achieve optimal levels of reach and frequency.** By working with a media planner, you can determine the levels of reach and frequency you can achieve with your budget. By analyzing what you can achieve with your resources, you can use them more effectively and efficiently. If you don’t have the resources to conduct a paid advertising campaign properly, it may be better to use the resources on another form of communication or to limit the focus of the campaign to one target audience or one message strategy. When funding increases, you can focus more broadly. If you choose to focus very narrowly at first, you’ll need to set expectations appropriately.

- **Advertising that is on strategy and breaks through ad clutter.** Spending millions of dollars on ad placement won’t suffice if your advertising is off strategy or doesn’t get noticed. Your ads must effectively communicate a message that will influence your target audience. Effectiveness can be determined by testing your commercials among the audience. With the amount of advertising in today’s media vehicles, your ads must also stand out enough that the audience notices and remembers them, and they must be sufficiently persuasive to move the audience toward different beliefs, attitudes, and/or behaviors.

- **Initial, ongoing, and postcampaign evaluations.** To determine whether your campaign has achieved its objectives, you’ll need to conduct multiple research studies. If possible, you should provide for:
  - A baseline measure of your audience’s precampaign awareness, attitudes, beliefs, and behaviors
  - Midcampaign measures of your audience’s response to the advertising and progress toward changing attitudes, beliefs, and other factors, so you can revise your ads or media strategy if necessary
  - A postcampaign evaluation to measure the results of your effort

### Placing a Public Service Announcement

PSAs are typically useful only for reaching a general audience with a general message. Because stations are donating time, the sponsoring organization has no control over when, where, and how often the PSA airs. Tracking
Table 7.2: Media Characteristics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Paid Media</th>
<th>Public Service Announcement</th>
<th>Earned Media</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Targeted</td>
<td>Not targeted</td>
<td>Somewhat targeted, but some audiences (e.g., low-literacy adults and teens) may be difficult to reach because they are not big consumers of news</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expensive to place</td>
<td>Inexpensive to place</td>
<td>Inexpensive to place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total control of message</td>
<td>Nearly total control of message</td>
<td>Not much control of message but much more control when done well</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expensive to produce but existing ads can be reapplied inexpensively</td>
<td>Expensive to produce but existing ads can be reapplied inexpensively</td>
<td>Expense dependent on event or story Sometimes no financial cost other than time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Talent fees paid every 13 weeks</td>
<td>Talent fees paid yearly</td>
<td>No talent fees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credibility depends on ad execution and audience’s perspective</td>
<td>Credibility depends on ad execution and audience’s perspective</td>
<td>Credibility typically greater for press stories than for ads Credibility somewhat dependent on media outlet</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

data from past PSA campaigns have shown that as many as one-half of PSAs are run late at night. This lack of control over the media placement makes PSAs ineffective for reaching specific or hard-to-reach audiences and makes their impact on audiences unreliable. PSAs are better used to raise the public’s general awareness of an issue. For this reason, PSA placement is generally not recommended when states are trying to make a significant impact, unless they have no alternative because of funding limits.

You have a few options for trying to place your PSA. The Ad Council selects certain issues for which it will support the creative development and placement of PSAs. But the organizations selected must provide the funds to produce the ads, and often, only national organizations or national causes are chosen. You can also work directly with the public affairs directors at networks and local stations to persuade them to air your PSA.

PSAs are most successfully placed when they have the following characteristics:
- Strong public service appeal that will benefit most of the station’s audience
- Local relevance to the station’s viewing area (Relevance can be achieved by tagging the ad with a local organization’s name, phone number, or both.)
- Coordinated as part of the bonus time of the paid portion of a campaign (See section on “Combining Approaches” later in this chapter.)
- High-quality production value

A little-known option for securing PSA placement is to work through state broadcasters’ associations. These groups offer Non-Commercial Sustaining Announcement (NCSA) programs, in which you pay the association a fee to guarantee that your PSA will run. In one large state, for about $30,000 for a month-long program, the association will guarantee that 70 percent of its member TV and radio stations will each air the spot 15 times, with an equal split among prime time, daytime, and other times. This type of arrangement is officially considered PSA use, because the stations are donating the airtime. The program is available only to government agencies or nonprofit groups. At the end of the month, the association provides a performance report outlining when and where the ads ran. This option is often used when funding is insufficient to conduct a paid campaign.

Obtaining Earned Media

Having your campaign messages reported in the popular press can greatly enhance the effectiveness of your media campaign. This approach is called earned media, because your program staff must work diligently with reporters and editors to gain news media coverage of your issue. These efforts can give your campaign credibility and additional exposure. Because most audiences view news media content as more objective than advertising, they’re often more receptive to the messages and perceive them as more credible. (See Chapter 8: Public Relations for in-depth discussion of earned media.)

How do you gain media coverage?

- **Identify the appropriate contacts within the media.** You can determine the appropriate contacts within the media by seeing who reports on your issue or by calling the news outlets. You may also want to note how the reporter frames the issue: Does he or she seem receptive to your message?

- **Establish yourself or your program as a resource for the media.** You can build a productive relationship with reporters and editors by providing data and background information. By positioning yourself as a resource for reporters and editors, you can help them in development of their stories. This relationship will increase the likelihood that they’ll contact you when they’re developing a future story on your issue.

- **Present newsworthy stories.** Mass media outlets are deluged with press releases and other suggestions for stories.
When you “pitch” a story to a media outlet, make sure the story has true value for its audience.

- **Provide supporting materials.** Doing the legwork for the writer or reporter will increase the chances of getting coverage of your story. Provide a press release, fact sheets, pictures, background information, video footage, short biographic sketches of key people, and other information, as appropriate.

- **Track your contacts with the media.** Keep notes each time you contact the media, listing the topics of your discussions, the information conveyed, the reporters and media contacted, and the angle used in covering your issue. This information will make your future efforts more effective.

## Combining Approaches

As mentioned earlier, mass media campaigns work best when paid media campaigns, PSAs (primarily for cost-efficiency), and earned media are used together. In this scenario, the paid media campaign serves as the core tool for reaching your target audience(s) with a controlled, sustained message that is most likely to be influential. PSAs and earned media are then used to supplement the paid campaign by reaching secondary audiences and providing a broader context for your campaign.

With most paid media campaigns, you can negotiate bonus weight, which is extra media time or placements given free by the media outlets for your purchase of other media time or placements. This bonus time is usually given on shows for which the station hasn't sold all the advertising slots. Because you can't choose the time of your ad's placement, bonus time may not reach your exact target, so it's more suitable for a message to the general audience that supplements the messages of your paid campaign and increases overall public support for your issue.

Earned media allows you to target your primary and secondary audiences more precisely. Media outreach will give your paid campaign credibility by encouraging the media to reinforce your messages. It will also provide more detail and supporting information than can be communicated in a 30-second TV spot. You can use media outreach to target practically any segment that watches or reads news and informational media, such as opinion leaders through editorial pages and news talk shows or parents through specialty magazines.

Using these three approaches in combination will provide a greater opportunity for your audience to be exposed to and influenced by your message.

## Working With Limited Resources

Not every organization has the resources to conduct a paid advertising campaign. When paid campaigns aren't possible, it's harder to target specific populations, but it's still possible to reach broad groups or the general public.

If you can't afford a paid campaign, you should consider reusing or producing one or more ads for PSA use for a general audience, to increase awareness of your issue; then use earned
Designing and Implementing an Effective Tobacco Counter-Marketing Campaign

**Evaluating Advertising Efforts**

Advertising is often the most expensive and time-consuming component of a tobacco counter-marketing campaign. With so much invested, several stakeholders will want to know whether you’re making a difference and whether funds are being used wisely. To demonstrate the success of your efforts, you should consider using three types of assessment: formative, process, and outcome evaluation. It’s also very important to involve an evaluation expert to help you develop and implement a rigorous evaluation appropriate for your campaign.

Rigorous evaluation can help you to justify your spending to stakeholders by showing that the ad campaign, not other factors, accounted for changes in the target audience. Formative evaluation can help you to determine whether you have the right strategy, message, and creative products, before you invest in media buys. Process evaluation allows you to keep track of what your ad agency and other contractors are implementing and to ensure that those activities meet your guidelines and objectives. Once your ads have been run, the outcome evaluation can help you to monitor the exposure of the target audience to your message(s), their awareness of the ads, and their ability to recall the message(s). Most important, you can use outcome evaluation to help you determine whether changes have occurred in the tobacco-related knowledge, attitudes, beliefs, intentions, or behaviors of your target audience.

**How To Evaluate the Advertising Campaign**

Depending on the scope and costs of your advertising effort, you should consider using formative evaluation during planning of your advertising campaign, process evaluation during implementation, and outcome evaluation during follow-up. Conducting formative evaluation during the planning phase will help you to learn which communication strategies and ad concepts have the highest likelihood of being effective and whether the communication pieces you’re developing leave the audience with the messages and impressions you intended. This evaluation can include research such as exploratory focus groups for audience insights, expert reviews, pretesting messages and materials, and pilot testing of an ad campaign that uses several communication channels (e.g., TV, radio, print, and billboards).

Process evaluation should be conducted as you implement your advertising activities, to
make sure your efforts are on track and in line with your guidelines and objectives. You'll need to conduct rigorous monitoring by regularly completing or reviewing logs and other documentation tools. For example, if your contractor agrees to pretest an ad by a certain date, a log can show whether all the steps to conduct the pretest were completed and whether they were done on time.

Process evaluation should also include monitoring your target audience's exposure to your advertising. You can obtain data on exposure, usually measured in reach and frequency, from your ad agency's reports on your media buy. These reports show information such as when and where your ads were aired, how many members of your target audience were exposed, and costs. Reports from companies such as Nielsen, Arbitron, and the Audit Bureau of Circulations are other sources of data on exposure. The reports can also tell you the demographics of the audience reached, when the ad ran or was aired, and the format of the stations that ran the ad.

Outcome evaluation will help you to learn what effect your advertising is having. As noted earlier, you'll at least need to conduct initial, ongoing, and postcampaign evaluations to determine whether your efforts are meeting your objectives. You and your evaluation expert will need to make certain decisions about methods to be used in conducting an outcome evaluation that's right for you. First, to design the evaluation, you'll have to decide which groups will be studied (e.g., smokers and nonsmokers) and when. Then you'll need to determine who will be in your sample and how it will be selected. Next you should decide what questions to ask your sample and what methods to use to get the data you need. Finally, you must determine how the data will be analyzed to obtain the answers you need for your evaluation.

**Using Evaluation Results for Decision Making**

If the evaluations are conducted well, your efforts can yield results that provide a sound basis for making project decisions. For example, the findings from your ad agency's reports on the media buy can help you to make decisions about ad placement over time. You can use the findings to compare results across markets in your state to see what worked and where. Also, reports that show ad placement by week can help you to decide how to time your outcome evaluation so you can gauge your audience's awareness of your advertising.

Tracking a target audience's awareness and message recall of an ad, as well as their overall reactions, can allow you to analyze the data by subgroups (e.g., age and race/ethnicity), to determine whether the ad has different effects on different groups. You can then make decisions about ad design and future placement of ads directed to these subgroups. If you're doing several types of advertising (e.g., TV, radio, and billboards), efforts to track awareness, recall, and reaction for each type can help you to determine which is the most effective and where to spend your advertising dollars. If you track your target audience's tobacco-related knowledge, attitudes, beliefs, and behaviors at several points during the flights of an ad, you also can gauge the ad's effectiveness over time.
Resources for Evaluation

This chapter covers some of the basics of evaluating an ad campaign. You also should review Chapter 5: Evaluating the Success of Your Counter-Marketing Program for more information about how to assess the impact of your whole counter-marketing program. CDC’s Office on Smoking and Health (OSH) is also preparing a manual that focuses on outcome evaluation for paid counter-advertising campaigns, which is scheduled for publication in late 2003. (Check http://www.cdc.gov/tobacco for updates on the availability of this manual.) Another publication offering evaluation information is CDC’s Introduction to Program Evaluation for Comprehensive Tobacco Control Programs, published in 2001.

Points To Remember

Although creative firms produce advertising, a manager within the tobacco control program must be the ultimate authority on what kind of advertising to produce. To effectively manage a creative firm, while still encouraging innovative ideas, the manager should focus on a handful of critical questions in four areas—logistics, strategy, creative, and exposure.

Logistics
- What contractual arrangements (e.g., incentives, results-based payments, and penalties) might encourage the creative firm to focus on your goals of behavior change?
- What guidelines are needed to set common expectations and ensure quality control of creative materials, media buys, billing, scope-of-work restrictions, and other important issues?

Strategy
- Have you and your agency developed a clear, written set of message strategies for each audience?
- Do the advertising strategies coordinate with other parts of the program at both the local and state levels?
- Considering that the tobacco industry, voluntary health organizations, the American Legacy Foundation, and other groups may already be reaching your audience, how does your campaign fit into the overall context of what your audience is hearing? How might you need to alter the campaign to be most cost efficient and effective?

Creative
- Is each creative product, from a TV spot to a T-shirt, on strategy?
- Can each product be disseminated effectively to your audience?
- Does each product reflect what you know about your audience?
- Once people are exposed to this creative product, could unintended negative consequences occur?

Exposure
- Are you reaching your audience effectively (i.e., gaining their attention and clearly communicating a message) and efficiently (i.e., for a reasonable price)?
- Are you reaching your audience through the right channel, at the right time, and in the right place?
Bibliography


