HHS Designation of Additional Members of the Special Exposure Cohort under the Energy Employees Occupational Illness Compensation Program Act of 2000

Designating a Class of Employees from Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory Livermore, California
I. Designation

I, Kathleen Sebelius, Secretary of Health and Human Services, designate the class of employees defined in Section II of this report for addition to the Special Exposure Cohort (SEC), as authorized under the Energy Employees Occupational Illness Compensation Program Act of 2000 (EEOICPA), 42 U.S.C. § 7384q.

[Signature on file] ________
Kathleen Sebelius

II. Employee Class Definition

All employees of the Department of Energy, its predecessor agencies, and their contractors and subcontractors who worked at the Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory in Livermore, California from January 1, 1950 through December 31, 1973, for a number of work days aggregating at least 250 work days, occurring either solely under this employment or in combination with work days within the parameters established for one or more other classes of employees in the Special Exposure Cohort.

III. Designation Criteria and Recommendations

Pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 7384q, for the class defined in Section II of this report, the Secretary has determined, and the Advisory Board on Radiation and Worker Health (Board) has recommended, that

1. it is not feasible to estimate with sufficient accuracy the radiation dose that the class received; and

2. there is a reasonable likelihood that such radiation dose may have endangered the health of members of the class.

The SEC final rule states in 42 C.F.R. § 83.13(c)(1) that it is feasible in two situations to estimate the radiation dose that the class received with sufficient accuracy. First, the rule states that radiation doses may be estimated with sufficient accuracy if NIOSH has established that it has access to sufficient information to estimate the maximum radiation dose for every type of cancer for which radiation doses are reconstructed that could have been incurred under plausible circumstances by any member of the class. Alternatively, radiation doses may be estimated with sufficient accuracy if NIOSH has established that it has access to sufficient information to estimate the radiation doses of members of the class more precisely than a maximum dose estimate.

The Board, pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 7384q, advised the Secretary to designate the class as an addition to the SEC in a letter received by the Secretary on March 8, 2010.
IV. Designation Findings

Feasibility of Estimating Radiation Doses with Sufficient Accuracy

The Secretary established the feasibility determination for the class of employees covered by this report based upon the findings summarized below.

- NIOSH lacks sufficient information, which includes biological monitoring data, sufficient air monitoring information, or sufficient process and radiological source information, to allow it to estimate with sufficient accuracy the potential internal exposures to mixed fission and/or activation product radionuclides to which the proposed class may have been subjected.

- NIOSH finds that it is likely feasible to reconstruct occupational medical dose for Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory (LLNL) workers with sufficient accuracy.

- There is currently a class of LLNL workers associated with a previous NIOSH evaluation of SEC petition SEC-00092:

  Employees of the Department of Energy (DOE), its predecessor agencies, and DOE contractors or subcontractors who were monitored for radiation exposure while working at the Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory from January 1, 1950 through December 31, 1973, for a number of work days aggregating at least 250 work days or in combination with work days within the parameters established for one or more other classes of employees in the Special Exposure Cohort.

  This class was added to the SEC effective April 2, 2008. This class was based on the NIOSH determination at that time, with the information then available, that all workers with the potential for radiation exposures during the proposed SEC class time period were included in the external dose monitoring program, and that unmonitored workers had no potential for radiation exposures.

- In the course of NIOSH’s ongoing dose reconstruction and continued data capture efforts, NIOSH has determined that the monitoring records are not complete for some LLNL workers who may have been exposed to fission and activation product radionuclides during the period from January 1, 1950 through December 31, 1973. Therefore, NIOSH has determined that the existence, or nonexistence, of LLNL monitoring records is not always an accurate indicator of a worker’s potential for radiation exposure during the period from January 1, 1950 through December 31, 1973. Accordingly, NIOSH has also determined that it is necessary to remove the “… who were monitored ...“ criterion from the description of the LLNL SEC class and, therefore, to expand the SEC class definition implemented in SEC-00092 to include all employees of DOE, its predecessor agencies, and their contractors and subcontractors who worked at LLNL during the specified time period.
• Pursuant to 42 C.F.R. § 83.13(c)(1), NIOSH determined that there is insufficient information to either: (1) estimate the maximum radiation dose, for every type of cancer for which radiation doses are reconstructed, that could have been incurred under plausible circumstances by any member of the class; or (2) estimate the radiation doses of members of the class more precisely than a maximum dose estimate.

• The Board concurred with the NIOSH evaluation and recommended the proposed class for addition to the SEC.

• Although NIOSH found that it is not possible to completely reconstruct radiation doses for the proposed class, NIOSH intends to use any internal and external monitoring data that may become available (and that can be interpreted using existing NIOSH dose reconstruction processes or procedures) for an individual claim. Dose reconstructions for individuals employed at LLNL during the period from January 1, 1950 through December 31, 1973, but who do not qualify for inclusion in the SEC, may be performed using these data as appropriate.

Health Endangerment

The Secretary established the health endangerment determination for the class of employees covered by this report based upon the findings summarized below.

(1) Pursuant to 42 C.F.R. § 83.13(c)(3), NIOSH established that there is a reasonable likelihood that such radiation doses may have endangered the health of members of the class. Pursuant to 42 C.F.R. § 83.13(c)(3)(ii), NIOSH specified a minimum duration of employment to satisfy this health endangerment criterion as “having been employed for a number of work days aggregating at least 250 work days within the parameters established for this class or in combination with work days within the parameters (excluding aggregate work day requirements) established for one or more other classes of employees in the Cohort.”

(2) NIOSH did not identify any evidence from the petitioners or from other resources that would establish that the class was exposed to radiation during a discrete incident likely to have involved exceptionally high-level exposures, such as a nuclear criticality incident, as defined under 42 C.F.R. § 83.13(c)(3)(i).

(3) The Board concurred with NIOSH's finding that the health of the class may have been endangered and defined the class according to the 250-work day requirement specified under 42 C.F.R. § 83.13(c)(3)(ii).
V. Effect and Effective Date of Designation


VI. Administrative Review of Designation

The health endangerment determination of the designation provided in this report may be subject to an administrative review within HHS, pursuant to 42 C.F.R. § 83.18(a). On the basis of such a review, if the Secretary decides to expand the class of employees covered by this designation, the Secretary would transmit a supplementary report to Congress providing the expanded employee class definition and the criteria and findings on which the decision was based.