Kimberly Flynn, Community Co-Chair
Robert Spencer, Labor Co-Chair

December 9, 2011
Committee Presentation
WTC HP Scientific/Technical Advisory

Monitoring and Treatment
Survivors Steering Committee
Health Program
The World Trade Center
Survivors' screening-eligible and certified-eligible WTC monitoring, and treatment programs for coordination of initial health evaluations, affected stakeholders and facilitate the

Legislative Mandate: To receive input from Committee of the WTC Environmental Health CTR
Successor to the Community Advisory Board
Created under the Zadroga Act

Survivors Steering Committee
World Trade Center
• Representatives of the population of residents, students, and area and other workers affected by the 9/11 terrorist attacks
• Screening-eligible and certified-eligible survivors receiving initial health evaluations, monitoring, or treatment and organizations advocating on their behalf
• Survivors, Steering Committee
• Members

Representatives of New York City
• Survivors...
Lower Manhattan on 9/11

WTC Collapse Cloud Engulfs
The WTC Collapse Cloud Approaching Chambers St.
The Collapse Cloud Deposited Dust Throughout A Densely Populated Urban Area
The Collapse Cloud Deposited Dust Throughout A Densely Populated Urban Area
Throughout Lower Manhattan
Months Emanating Smoke
Fires Burned At The Site For
Residential Buildings Bordering the WTC Site
EPA Declares Air Safe

"Given the scope of the tragedy from last week, I am glad to reassure the people of New York...that their air is safe to breathe and their water is safe to drink."

Christine Todd Whitman
EPA Administrator
September 18, 2001
Severely Distorted EPA Risk Communications

In 2011, ProPublica, working from documents obtained under FOIA by the NY Committee on Occupational Safety and Health reveals just how far that interference went:

- In 2003, the EPA Inspector General reveals that the White House Council on Environmental Quality interfered with EPA news releases providing guidance to downtown residents and workers, minimizing health concerns.

- In 2011, ProPublica, working from documents obtained under FOIA by the NY Committee on Occupational Safety and Health reveals just how far that interference went:
"opened on September 17th.
offices as soon as the financial district
instead were urged to return to their
Water Street – was rewritten and workers
throughout the financial district –
should not report to work on a busy
instance, a warning that people

RISK COMMUNICATIONS
SEVERELY DISTORTED EPA
Procedures:

- In the workplace, speak to your supervisor to see if there are special startup and cleaning procedures.
- Additional precautions: Women and young children do not need to take additional precautions. No. Pregnant women and young children need not take additional precautions.
- Do pregnant women and young children need to use a wet rag or wet mop? "Dust is to use a wet rag or wet mop."
- How should I clean the dust in my apartment?

Advisories - September 2001
NYC Department of Health
East Side
Allen-Pike Sts
South of
West Side
South of Canal St

Boundaries
Program
Test & Clean
2002-2003

EPA
Chambers Street

Residents on 9/11

Canal Street

Residents on 9/11

Workers & Volunteers

on 9/11

Students on 9/11

at Site 9/11-6/30/02
Mariama James

Southbridge Towers resident and parent

- Large apt complex near South St Seaport
- Member, Manhattan Community Board #1,
  Youth and Education Committee
- On 9/11, Mariama, 8 months pregnant,
  returned home covered in dust.
- Her father is caught in the dust cloud. Her
two children return covered in dust as well.
Collapse Cloud Approaches

Southbridge Towers on 9/11
Mariama James

Dust has permeated the apartment and young children.

City Health Department advises no precautions needed for pregnant women and young children.

Without realizing the risks, she rips up a contaminated carpet.
are astronomical. Pediatric pulmonologist Treatment costs program for children, Mariama seeks out a pediatric pulmonologist. With no WTC on a host of medications. With which they are aerodigestive problems for which they are All 3 children develop 9/11-related .

2001, is diagnosed with asthma at 10 mos.

Mariama’s youngest child, born October

Mariama James
be funded by NIOSH.

Physical health impacts to children must

The WT C Pediatric study Investigating

Asthma, Sinusitis, and GERD.

WT C EH C's Pediatric Program for Chronic

Her children are now being treated at the

Mariama James
Respiratory problems common for tenants

Wide ventilation system
- Heating and air conditioning units and building

WTC dust entered through windows, apartment

Materials in its construction

No interior source of lead or asbestos containing

WTC site, a 52-story rental high rise built 1990.

Resident at 105 Duane St, 7 blocks north of the

Jo Pollet
asbestos.

and analyzes sample by TEM for method 5755-95 published by the ASTM on 10th floor by micro-vac according to samples supply air defuser (hallway vent) 12/3/01: Certified Industrial Hygienist Certified Industrial Hygienist

little visible dust, but contaminants shown

Jo Pollet
300 times expected background.
Either way, asbestos level found is between 50
structures per sq. cm.

urban area might have levels up to 10,000
studies show poorly maintained buildings in an
> 1,000 asbestos structures per sq. cm. (Some
expected background for building without ACM
structures per sq. cm.

Sample tests positive @ 550,000 asbestos
Jo Pollet
contaminants through halls and into apt.

Shows ventilation system circulating.

Finds 123,000 asbestos structures per sq. cm.

7/02: Sampling of entry doorframe of 5th floor apt.

- Ultra-fine particulates and metals.
  - Fibrous glass, cristalline silica, concrete, PAHS.
  - For presence of other contaminants such as WTC asbestos. Presence of asbestos a marker.

Jo Polet
sg. cm.

Guidance: 16,700 asbestos structures per unit ran post-9/11 according to NYC DOH.

- Sampling of apt. heating/air conditioning structures per sg. cm.
- Unused post 9/11: 37,000 asbestos.

Jo Pollet
benchmark for lead

dioxin, four exceeded EPA health-based
Of 8 apartments sampled for heavy metals and
antimony 627 micrograms per sq ft
EPA antimony wipe sample: 1090 micrograms

EPA antimony wipe sample of 25 micrograms per sq ft
based benchmark per sq ft – 5 times EPA's health

127 micrograms per sq ft

5/03: EPA Lead wipe sample of bedroom floor:

Jo Poleit
ordered back to work
9/20: Galli and thousands of other city workers

9/18: EPA Administrator Whitman issues "air is

safe advisory

return to work

Mayor orders non-essential city workers not to

Mayor Dean of Chambers & Centre Sts)

WTC

WTC

not in the immediate area of the WTC

Galli Benzman
bleeds.

pain, headaches, pressure in chest, nose

Compromised – coughing, sore throat, sinus

9/25: Reports health effects to Deputy

almost immediately

She experiences breathing problems
dust is resuspended and coating surfaces

On her return, outdoor air is full of smoke.

Gail Benzeman
asthma, then GERD, chronic sinusitis.
Clinic. Diagnosed with new onset RADs and
J. Selikoff Occupational and Environmental
Her employer arranges visit to Mt. Sinai's Irving

Increasing absences due to illness

prescribed many medications
10/17: First of many medical appointments;
Told to go home if she feels sick. Air is safe.

Cail Benzman
Primary insurance does not cover.

- 2007: Sang in workers comp case leaves her benefits.
- Medical expenses, as well as lifetime medical
- Workers Comp Board reimburses for prior
- She had not worked on the "pile."
- Attorneys mostly refuse to accept her case since
- Claim.
- Considers disability, files workers compensation

Gail Benzman
Health Center.
Recently examined at WTC Environmental.
She was not at work below Chambers St on 9/11.
Not eligible for the WTC Health Registry since.
People live in the state.
Health issues although 1700 9/11 affected.
Finds Florida doctors have little expertise in 9/11.
Fewer attacks.
RADS, chest pain, sinusitis, GERD, etc.
Remain.
Retires to Florida in 2010.

Gal Benzman
Daily breathing fumes because authorities said air is safe. Dismissed worries about health risks of
beginning after 9/11. Fumes, burning smell is intense and constant.

Health problems. On 9/11, Mitch was 12, Amanda was 9. No prior
York Police Department.
Senior Police Administrative Aide with the New
Parent of two children: Mitch and Amanda
Lower East Side Resident (above Canal Street)

Lillian Bermudez
Hospitalization

Continue to have crises - at least 4 require medications.

Mitch given new diagnosis of asthma and prescribed days, then 5 more days as he is stable/monitored.

ER visit: Mitch is hospitalized in Bellevue's ICU for 3 cough.

Late October 2001, Mitch comes down with a cold &

Lillian Bermudez
In 2007, both children first treated at the WTC EHC and are now "doing great."

Because of where they live, the children did not qualify for the Health Registry.

In 2002, Amanda is diagnosed with sinusitis; has recurrences every time she gets a cold.

Lillian Bermudez
Students

9/11 health issues of former Stuyvesant
Founder of StuyHealth advocacy group

Patient at WTC Environmental Health Ctr

Street

School at Chambers Street and West
Student on 9/11 at Stuyvesant High

Lila Nordstrom
- Alumni now widely dispersed geographically
- Debris barge outside school for months
- Reoccupancy before full remediation
- School engulfed in dust cloud

Lila Nordstrom
Amit Friedlander’s statement: Significant dust and debris exposure. 4 years post-9/11 diagnosed with Hodgkin’s lymphoma.

Health conditions heavily reported among student body include respiratory and gastrointestinal disorders. Reports of cancer and autoimmune disorders.
Dust Cloud About to Reach Stuyvesant High School on 9/11

Stuyvesant is the building center right in photo, just past the Hudson River "pier inlet" lower right
& Debris Barge (right)
Stuyvesant High School (left)
26 barge site
"pile" to the Pier
traveling from the
debirs trucks
become airborne
Dust often

HS & BMCC on West Street
Debris Truck Passing StudyesanT