UPDATE ON NHANES DNA DATA DISCUSSION

Board of Scientific Counselors September 18, 2008

Jennifer Madans





SAFER · HEALTHIER · PEOPLE

Introduction

• Background:

- DNA has been collected (1991-94, 1999-2004, 2007+) by the NHANES program and is stored for future testing
- Program in place to make DNA available for testing; to date testing has been limited but is increasing
- Current interest by CDC and NIH in testing 'the whole genome'
- Issue:
 - NCHS considers DNA sequence information to be an 'identifier'
 - Options under consideration to expand access

Legislative Requirements for Confidentiality--NHANES

- Public Health Service Act Section 308(d)
 - NCHS is restricted from releasing identifiable data to anyone
 - Unless there is explicit consent
- CIPSEA beginning in 2002, heavier fines and penalties for release of identifiable data

Proposal Process to Conduct Genetic Testing on NHANES DNA Specimens

- Proposals accepted to conduct specific DNA tests
- Proposals solicited through a Federal Register notice and are reviewed by three panels
 - Scientific technical panel (meets twice a year)
 - Internal CDC panel of senior scientists
 - Institutional Review Board
- Researchers receive de-identified DNA samples for genotyping
- Test results are sent to NCHS where they are linked to requested NHANES data
- Researchers access data for analysis in the RDC on site or remotely

Proposal Process for Secondary Analysis of Genetic Data

- Genetic data can be analyzed with the thousands of phenotypic variables available from NHANES
- Proposals for secondary data analysis are accepted three times annually and follow the usual RDC process
- Except that they are reviewed by NCHS' IRB (no review by Technical Panel)
- Researchers with accepted proposals conduct their genotype-phenotype analyses in the NCHS' RDC on site or remotely

Beyond Gene Discovery Initiative

- CDC's National Office of Public Health Genomics (NOPHG) Initiative
- Estimated 1,000,000 + genetic variations
 - Each participant's 1,000,000 genetic variations can be done on a chip the size of a standard slide
- Fund raising stage (estimated \$ 20 million)
- Funding not included in the CDC budget for testing NHANES DNA samples

Genome Wide Association Studies (GWAS)

- GWAS studies compare very large numbers of genetic variations to a health outcome (phenotype) of interest
- Many studies use cohort or case/control participants
- NHANES would provide a valuable sample to do original research as well as verify results from other studies
 - Representative of the U.S.
 - Multiple race/ethnicities
 - 'Normal' controls for case/control studies

GWAS Challenges

- Large data sets
- Multiple genetic pathways/complex genetic analyses
- QC process complex
- Many GWAS methods still in development
- Institutions sometimes write their own research software
- Computationally intensive
- Disclosure risks of new methods need to be assessed

Potential Ways to Expand Access

- Institute a remote access system
- Offer access to designated agents (under review with OMB)
- Open additional research data centers
- Address consent issue:
 - Reconsent of NHANES III and NHANES 1999-2002 participants
 - Change consent for future NHANES

E-mail based Remote Access

- Email-based remote access to NHANES genotypic and phenotypic database has been put in place.
 - Part of NCHS RDC
 - Researchers can access but cannot see identifiable data
- Planned development and evaluation of GWAS applications in a remote access environment
 - Have not begun due to budget constraints.

Designated Agent Authority

- NCHS could enter into legally-binding agreements with a limited number of outside researchers to allow the controlled, conditional release of individual-level, potentially-identifiable data with oversight by NCHS
- NCHS has the authority to designate agents for access to data collected post 2002.
- Authority to designate agents for data collected through 2002 is under review at OMB – meeting held Sept 5 with OMB legal staff.
- Access procedures under a designated agent authority would need to be commensurate with the confidentiality risk and sensitivity of the data and would require significant oversight

Open Additional RDC Locations

- Add additional NCHS locations to offer access to NCHS sensitive data sets including genetic data
- Plans have been finalized for an Atlanta RDC but funding has not as yet been secured

Changes to Informed Consent

Change NHANES informed consent so that confidentiality is not promised

- Questions raised regarding the appropriateness of this approach for NHANES
- Initial plan to obtain community input has been put on hold – NIH sponsored a similar activity
- A November workshop on collecting, storing, protecting and accessing biological data, sponsored by NIA and conducted by CPOP and CNSTAT may address consent issues

NCHS' Activities to Expand Data Access Planned or Currently Underway

- Continue to improve current remote access system
 - Additional options tailored to genetic analyses
 - Expand menu of commercial software packages
- Develop mechanisms with appropriate confidentiality protections for Designated Agents accessing data protected by CIPSEA for a limited number of projects that cannot be done on the remote system
- Develop access tools in the NCHS RDC(s) to address the needs of GWAS projects
 - Computational requirements
 - Need for user developed software